

**PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS:
EXPECTATIONS OF PRIVATE SECTOR PARTNERS FOR INTERNATIONAL ANIMAL HEALTH
AND LIVESTOCK SECTOR DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMMES**

S.J. Thevasagayam¹, I. Dieuzy-Labaye², E. Tagliaro²

¹ Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, P.O. Box 23350, Seattle, WA 98121, United States of America

² World Organisation for Animal Health, 12 rue de Prony, 75017 Paris, France

***Summary:** The roles and responsibilities of national Veterinary Services are continuing to expand, triggered by multiple global trends, including: the increased demand for animal protein, the (re-) emergence of zoonotic pathogens and public health risks such as antimicrobial resistance. Furthermore, the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals provide an opportunity for Veterinary Services to contribute to the achievement of these goals (1, 3). Together, these pressures exert an unprecedented responsibility on the veterinary profession to ensure a safer and healthier global community. Hindered by the scarcity of resources and capacities within the public or private spheres of Veterinary Services, Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) offer a tangible and timely solution to address this complex environment and fulfil societal demands. Examples of sustainable "Win-Win" partnerships are multiple and exist where public and private sectors share common goals to deliver desired outcomes collectively. National Delegates to the OIE are encouraged to initiate effective PPPs to meet the demands on the veterinary profession, thereby contributing to a better society for today and tomorrow.*

***Key words:** Public Private Partnerships, livestock, Veterinary Services*

1. PPPs as a means to improve Veterinary Services' capacities and achieve development objectives

Global trends suggest that the demand for animal protein is expected to rise at a higher rate than in the recent past, particularly in LMICs, fuelled by an increase in per capita income, urbanization and changing food preferences. Moreover, food and nutritional security will also result in the increased demand for animal sourced foods. For the 60% of world's poorest populations, livestock provides a livelihood, an opportunity to increase their income, a way to store wealth and a path out of poverty. As countries progress through the stages of agricultural transformation in their economic development pathway, the livestock sector offers a means through which agricultural production can be diversified and labour can be employed towards higher value commodities.

The 2030 United Nation's Agenda for Sustainable Development established seventeen aspirational objectives - the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) - which encourage governments, international organisations, the private sector and civil society to contribute to its achievements by 2030. In striving towards achieving these SDGs, and as documented extensively by FAO (FAO, 2016), the livestock sector has a prominent role to play. Realising the promise and potential of the livestock sector in a sustainable and responsible way necessitates the optimal health and welfare of animals through the active engagement of Veterinary Services involving both public and private sectors.

Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) are a collaborative approach in which the public and private sector share resources, responsibilities and risks to achieve common objectives and mutual benefits in a sustainable manner. PPPs can be highly effective vehicles for tackling complex challenges and hold perhaps the greatest promise in lower-middle-income countries (LMIC) to deal with diminishing resources available from the public sector. This contention is supported by significant literature narrating numerous examples of successful PPPs (2) that have reinforced the provision of veterinary services.

PPPs could be considered a key solution for strengthening Veterinary Services, animal health delivery and require building formal links between the public veterinary administrations and a number of actors from the private sector, including: private veterinary practitioners, veterinary para-professionals (VPPs) and community animal health workers; private companies from the pharmaceutical or food industry; and trade associations, among others. In the case of individual veterinarians and VPPs, these links can take the form of contracts or sanitary mandates for the provision of specific services. The delegation of responsibilities to other service providers requires supportive institutional and legislative frameworks. There is also a need to build capacity within countries to prepare meaningful legislation, establish and manage effective Veterinary Statutory Bodies (VSB) and enforce standards of practice.

2. The OIE and Public-Private Partnerships

The good governance of Veterinary Services is a fundamental underlying principle for providing sustainable animal health services to livestock keepers, for sustaining economies, for preventing and responding to global animal health risks and related public health risks. National Veterinary Services, which operate in good governance and in compliance with intergovernmental standards, are defined in section 3 on the ‘Quality of Veterinary Services’ of the OIE *Terrestrial Animal Health Code (Terrestrial Code)* and *Aquatic Animal Health Code (Aquatic Code)*. In order to operate in good governance, Veterinary Services must be sustainably financed, universally available and efficiently provided without waste or duplication and in a manner that is transparent and free of fraud. In order to do so, they must be supported by a comprehensive and clear regulatory framework that is properly implemented.

It is recognized that the good governance of animal health systems is also dependent on close PPPs between interested parties involved in animal product supply chains; these partnerships should include public (regulatory) and private (practicing) sector, veterinarians, VPPs and para-professional staff, national laboratories, pharmaceutical and vaccine manufacturers, producers, processors, and distributors. Task sharing between the public and private sectors, with an accountable State assuming responsibility for the efficient functioning of animal health and livestock delivery systems, is essential. Critical areas of activity where PPPs can assist in good governance include: animal disease surveillance, data collection, early detection and response to disease outbreaks, eradication of animal diseases, coordination and implementation of specific disease control programs, including vaccination, provision of clinical services, drug manufacturing and distribution, extension activities, as well as food safety (ante and post mortem inspections at abattoirs), and enforcement of veterinary legislation.

Veterinary legislation is an essential element of a nation’s infrastructure; it provides the powers and authorities necessary for public and private components of Veterinary Services to efficiently carry out their functions in the veterinary domain. Following its adoption in the *Terrestrial Code* in May 2012, Chapter 3.4 provides advice and assistance to OIE Members when formulating or modernizing veterinary legislation so as to comply with OIE intergovernmental standards. This supports Member Countries in their endeavors to ensure good governance of the entire veterinary domain. In order to be effective, veterinary legislation should be prepared by veterinarians and legal drafters in consultation with interested parties, including the private sector; contribute to an overall national strategic vision; and provide comprehensive coverage of the veterinary domain.

Another crucial element of an efficient national animal health system is the VSB. As described in Article 3.2.12 of the *Terrestrial Code*, the VSB is an autonomous national institution that oversees the licensing and registration of the veterinary profession and para-professions and ensures ethical and technical standards of veterinary practice. It should have the legal authority to exercise and enforce control of veterinarians and VPPs; it should play an important role of defining and bridging responsibilities between public and private components of Veterinary Services and set the standards of education and competence for veterinarians and VPPs to ensure that private sector individuals engaged or accredited through contract or sanitary mandate are qualified to carry out the assigned duties. VSBs are a critical tool for ensuring effective public-private partnerships in national animal health systems.

3. The Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation's experience with Public-Private Partnerships

The Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation works through partners to progress its belief that “*every person deserves the chance to live a healthy, productive life*” as epitomized in the Foundation’s mantra. All partnerships are defined with a clear purpose towards a desired impact that is sustainable beyond the partnership period. The impact, which can be measured, is clearly defined and co-owned amongst the partners with appropriate metrics and mechanisms for measurement that will allow partners to assess progress, measure return on investment and capture learnings. Sustainability is a key success criterion assessed by the value created to the stakeholders that enables self-sustainability of the intervention catalyzed initially by philanthropy. Experience has clearly shown that both public and private sector players are essential to realise true impact that is sustainable.

Shared governance, funding and delivery models between public and private sectors are increasingly becoming the norm. The Veterinary Authority recognises that best outcomes are achieved in their programmes when there is strong alignment and support from the private sector. This has been proven to be true across the development and implementation of standards, the delivery of services, effecting enduring behavioural change to achieve improved animal health and welfare. The Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation has interacted with other stakeholders in the private sector to understand their business motivations to engage with Veterinary Services and the challenges that they face concerning the provision of effective veterinary services, particularly in LMICs. Despite the willingness of the private sector to invest in Veterinary Services and the animal health market, the private sector remains hindered due to multiple challenges, such as: (i) lack of clear delegation of responsibilities, (ii) transparent governance for private sector to play a complementary role in assisting the public sector with its operations, (iii) functional regulatory framework, (iv) consistent application of rules across sectors, and (v) an enabling policy environment. The aforementioned issues must be addressed by the public sector, if it is to seek the contribution of the private sector in increasing the effectiveness of Veterinary Services.

This paper is intended to raise awareness of PPPs supported by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation’s Livestock Program and to share learnings. These selected case studies demonstrate the value of PPPs in responding to collective needs and inspire the development of future PPPs.

3.1. Ethiopia: Government of Ethiopia - *EthioChicken* - Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation partnership on poultry production

The Ethiopian Government is currently implementing the Growth and Transformation Plan II (GTP II) (4) with the ambition to become a middle income country by 2025. The Livestock Master Plan of the Ethiopian Government defines the road map for livestock’s contribution to achieving the GTP II. Among others, the Livestock Master Plan has established a clear target to increase production of poultry meat and eggs (5).

The Ethiopian Government has extensive agriculture infrastructure and facilities, an important force of agricultural extension workers (approximately 60,000), locally adapted breeds of poultry and the Veterinary Authority. Recognising the potential of the private sector contribution, the Ethiopian Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries facilitated a PPP arrangement to multiply improved dual purpose, low input poultry to increase the production of eggs and poultry meat. The private sector entity, *EthioChicken*, entered into this PPP with the shared goal to achieve this target and a commitment to create employment for rural women and youth.

In addition to leasing its facilities for poultry multiplication, the role of the public sector was central in:

- Providing necessary permits to test and introduce an improved dual purpose chicken, thus meeting consumer taste preferences and addressing issues linked to disease and environmental resilience;
- Encouraging the extension workforce to be involved in the initiative, thus creating opportunities for training and for individuals to become competent in poultry production, business management and entrepreneurship;
- Enabling the importation of OIE-compliant veterinary vaccines in order to minimize disease related losses.

Positive benefits accrued to date include: the Government hatchery that once produced 40,000 day old chicks (DOCs) per year is now producing over 100,000 DOCs per week; various personnel, from veterinarians to farm workers, are being recruited, trained and rewarded based on results; extension workers' income is being supplemented by the services they provide to support low-input poultry production; and farmers have gained access to poultry that grow fast, lay more eggs and are resilient to environmental conditions. Independent monitoring and evaluation to assess the impact of this PPP has demonstrated an increase in household income and in the consumption of nutritious food as well as generating employment opportunities for many communities.

Today, this PPP is fulfilling the objectives of the Ethiopian Government and those of *EthioChicken*. Furthermore it is creating a positive impact towards livestock's contribution in responding to societal needs thereby enabling increased income, employment opportunities, food security and nutritional benefits for the Ethiopian community.

3.2. India: PPP to support poultry and small ruminant vaccine provision. Government of Jharkhand, India - Hester BioSciences and Global Alliance for Livestock Veterinary Medicines (GALVmed)

The lack of access to quality veterinary vaccines remains a significant challenge in many parts of India, caused by an unreliable supply chain to rural small holder farmers. Moreover, poultry and small ruminants are neglected priorities of both public and private sectors of Veterinary Services, thus hindering the control of Newcastle Disease and Peste des Petits Ruminants (PPR) in Jharkhand. To counter this situation, the Jharkhand State Livelihood Promotion Society (JSLPS) entered into a PPP in 2016 with Hester Biosciences Limited to extend the delivery of poultry and small ruminant vaccination and health care services in remote areas of Jharkhand. This PPP was facilitated by GALVmed, a not-for-profit animal health product development organization.

Under the PPP, the JSLPS is deploying vaccinators who will use Newcastle Disease vaccination for backyard poultry and the PPR vaccine for small ruminants and other animal health care products. Hester Biosciences Limited is enabling access to customised veterinary products for the benefit of poor livestock keepers and their targeted animal populations. GALVmed is supporting the vaccine innovations developed by Hester Biosciences and offering training to JSLPS vaccinators in Newcastle disease and PPR.

Moreover, this PPP also aims to address issues related to the low use of Newcastle Disease vaccines in Jharkhand. Although effective and affordable vaccines are available, Newcastle Disease remains one of the major threats to backyard low-input poultry production. The lack of appropriate packaging and vial sizes continue to hinder access to and use of these vaccines by rural poor farmers who can least afford the losses in their flocks. Hester Biosciences Limited in its capacity as a Newcastle Disease vaccine manufacturer has offered to address the vaccine packaging size should adequate demand be confirmed and with the financial and technical support of GALVmed. The Indian Government provided the necessary approvals and supported the production of smaller packaging sizes (100 dose vials) and a distribution channel to reach the remote rural poor farmers was established by JSLPS. This PPP has resulted in thousands of households being able to access high quality vaccines which were previously unavailable to them, thus supporting the poverty reduction strategies, pro-poor schemes and programmes advocated by the Indian Government.

3.3. Kenya: Sidai Africa - Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation

Sidai Africa, a social enterprise, was established to ensure the reliable supply of quality veterinary products and veterinary service for livestock keepers and pastoralists in Kenya. Sidai Africa was founded in 2011 and aims to establish a network of at least 150 franchised and branded Livestock Service Centres in Kenya.

Sidai Africa is another example of an initiative which depends on the close collaboration between public and private sector partners to source and supply quality products for its customers. Sidai Africa strives to ensure that the products it offers are of high and consistent quality, and are transported and stored appropriately and used in alignment with needs.

Whilst this is not a direct partnership with the Government, this case demonstrates how the Government of Kenya has enabled the private sector to complement veterinary service delivery and provide high quality veterinary products to remote areas. Based on this positive experience and more recently, Sidai Africa has considered entering into partnerships with state governments; these specific PPPs would further the support to the implementation of vaccination campaigns, increasing access to infrastructure and equipment, as well as enforcing laws on counterfeit and sub-standard veterinary products. Sidai Africa's network of franchises also closely liaises with the Veterinary Medicines Directorate in order to improve the regulatory framework of the Veterinary Services. In terms of outcomes, this PPP will improve disease surveillance and control in Kenya, thereby directly benefitting the incomes, welfare and household security of 300,000 livestock-keeping households in Kenya.

4. Ongoing efforts between the OIE and Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation

The Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation is pleased to partner with OIE on the Public Private Progress initiative, a three-year grant, established in October 2016, with the objective to support OIE Members make progress in developing sustainable PPP arrangements to improve the quality of animal health, the health and well-being of people and the reliability of veterinary service delivery and the universality of the services provided. This will be via: identifying fundamental obstacles and deficiencies currently inhibiting the development of PPPs, supporting national Veterinary Services to overcome these hurdles, and fostering a collaborative relationship between Veterinary Services and private sector actors in animal health and food safety to leverage the strengths of both public and private sectors. The initiative will draw upon existing experiences of successful cases of PPPs towards improved Veterinary Services and will solicit input from National Delegates to the OIE around the world; this will be in the form of questionnaires and interviews, to identify such case studies and highlight opportunities and impediments to fruitful PPPs in the animal health and livestock sectors.

5. Conclusion: Key lessons and the expectations of private sector partners

The three examples highlighted in this report demonstrate the potential of public and private sector collaboration to enhance the effectiveness of Veterinary Services' delivery and to meet the needs of today's society. The success of these PPPs depends on the following common criteria: (i) recognition that the collective efforts are more effective than independent efforts of the public or private sector, (ii) willingness of the public sector to create an enabling environment and of the private sector to contribute its resources and capabilities, and (iii) identification of shared goals for both the public and private sectors with clear delegation of responsibilities. It is clear that success and sustainability of PPPs are dependent upon the achievement of these shared goals, as well as meeting the needs of each vested party.

It is now an opportune time for the veterinary profession and for national Veterinary Authorities to maximize the potential of the livestock sector and its contribution to achieve SDGs by extending its collaboration with the private sector. As demonstrated by the case studies in this report, expanded collaboration with the private sector can lead to an increase in resources, capacities and capabilities for the benefits of all. Given the OIE's membership of 180 Members and the direct relationship with Chief Veterinary Officers, the OIE is ideally placed to play a significant role in encouraging the establishment of PPPs, when needed and when relevant, in support of animal health and livestock sector development.

The private sector is ready and willing to complement the efforts of national Veterinary Authorities, provided that there is a clear delegation of responsibilities, transparent governance, functional regulatory framework and consistent application of rules. Additionally, private sector actors also require that the outputs and outcomes of the actions undertaken within the partnership are measured to assess impact and return on investment. The achievement of the aforementioned will ensure continued commitment and resources from the private sector to further the sustainability of PPPs.

The Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation aims to continue its close collaboration with the OIE and further contribute to the efforts of its Member towards taking advantage of effective and durable PPPs in support of animal health and livestock sector development.

Bibliography

1. FAO – AGAL, (2016). Synthesis: Livestock and the Sustainable Development Goals. Global Agenda for Sustainable Livestock. Livestock Information Sector Analysis, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.
 2. Ahuja V. (2004). The economic rationale of public private sector roles in the provision of animal health services. *Rev. sci. tech. Off. int. epiz.*, **23**(1), 33-45.
 3. United Nations - Sustainable Development Goals (2015). UN-.ORG.
 4. National Planning Commission (2016). Growth and Transformation Plan II. Published at www.ethpress.gov.et.
 5. Ethiopia Livestock Master Plan (2015). Roadmaps for growth and transformation. cgspace.cgiar.org.
-

© **World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE), 2017**

This document has been prepared by specialists convened by the OIE. Pending adoption by the World Assembly of Delegates of the OIE, the views expressed herein can only be construed as those of these specialists.

All OIE publications are protected by international copyright law. Extracts may be copied, reproduced, translated, adapted or published in journals, documents, books, electronic media and any other medium destined for the public, for information, educational or commercial purposes, provided prior written permission has been granted by the OIE.

The designations and denominations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the OIE concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers and boundaries.

The views expressed in signed articles are solely the responsibility of the authors. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by the OIE in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned.