



Organisation  
Mondiale  
de la Santé  
Animale

World  
Organisation  
for Animal  
Health

Organización  
Mundial  
de Sanidad  
Animal

Original: English

June 2011

## REPORT OF THE TENTH MEETING OF THE OIE ANIMAL WELFARE WORKING GROUP

Paris (France), 21–23 June 2011

On behalf of Dr Bernard Vallat, OIE Director General, Dr Sarah Kahn welcomed members and participants to the meeting of the Animal Welfare Working Group (AWWG). She made reference to discussions at the World Assembly of Delegates, held in May 2011, as background to present the strategic priorities for the OIE and the issues to be considered by the Working Group at this meeting. The list of participants and the agenda are attached as [Appendices I and II](#).

Dr Sarah Kahn briefly discussed the following priority issues:

- Standards for livestock production systems including state of play with *ad hoc* Groups on broiler chickens and beef cattle
- How to help and encourage Members in the implementation of standards
- Review of linkages between animal welfare, food safety and food security
- Future work on standards for the welfare of working animals
- The 3<sup>rd</sup> OIE Global Conference on Animal Welfare.

With respect to the challenge the OIE faces to encourage Members to adopt standards dealing with livestock production systems, Dr David Wilkins invited members to consider the history of the Council of Europe that uses the term ‘recommendation’, not ‘standard’. He mentioned that countries that have signed and ratified the Convention are not obliged to put the recommendations into law; for example they can implement the recommendations via the use of Codes of Practice. Representatives of countries were voting participants, while industry and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) attended as observers. Dr Wilkins undertook the task to circulate a copy of the document “The European Convention for the Protection of Animals kept for Farming purposes”, plus relevant guiding principles developed by the Council of Europe and International Coalition for Farm Animal Welfare (ICFAW). However, Mr Luc Mirabito underlined that there were also several issues in the Council of Europe and some recommendations were never adopted, despite many years of discussions.

Prof. Hassan Aidaros commented that the pace of introduction of new standards must be acceptable for all the OIE Members, not only for the wealthier countries. There is a risk that too rapid progress will lead to disconnection of a majority of Members. He agreed with Dr Sarah Kahn that there was a need to put more emphasis on helping countries to implement the standards, including by providing seminars to raise awareness and train focal points in the veterinary services.

Dr David Bayvel agreed that it is a key role of the Working Group to ensure that the work of the OIE addresses the need to help and encourage Members to implement standards, as appropriate to their national circumstances.

## Meeting with the OIE Director General

On the third day of the meeting Dr Vallat, OIE Director General, joined the Working Group to discuss some key points from the Working Group meeting, as set out below. Note: these points should be read in conjunction with the entire meeting report.

### a. OIE Collaborating Centres – new rules, with particular reference to animal welfare needs

Prof. Fraser raised the concerns of the Working Group regarding the situation with the new OIE policy on Collaborating Centres, notably the decision to approve one Collaborating Centre per region or, exceptionally, per sub-region. He noted that animal welfare is not a single uniform subject. In fact, there are many specific aspects within ‘animal welfare’, such as laboratory animals; the humane management of stray dogs; transport, intensive and extensive livestock production systems and livestock slaughter procedures. Prof. Fraser concluded that institutes with specialised expertise in these various aspects could provide valuable support to the OIE.

Dr Vallat agreed that the Working Group should submit a proposal to the OIE, including details of the type of specialisations that could be envisaged within the overall subject of animal welfare. In addition, the new rules for Reference Centres would be discussed by the elected Commissions and by the OIE Council at its next meeting (20 September 2011).

### b. Definition of the role of FAO vis-a-vis the standard setting role of the OIE in animal welfare endorsed at Director General level

Dr Bayvel recalled that, at the 79<sup>th</sup> General Session, Dr Vallat had commented on the future definition of roles and responsibilities of the FAO in regard to animal welfare, and invited him to update the Working Group on progress and next steps. Dr Vallat replied that the definition of roles and responsibilities of OIE and FAO had been clearly addressed in a chart and a *Vade Mecum* on animal health in 2008. This agreement does not deal with roles and responsibilities for animal welfare. Subsequently, FAO had started to work on animal welfare, without agreement with the OIE. Dr Vallat stated that the OIE Council had recommended discussing this matter with the incoming Director General of FAO at an early opportunity.

### c. Teaching animal welfare as part of the OIE recommendations on veterinary education

Dr Sira Abdul Rahman commended the OIE Initiative on Veterinary Education and asked the Director General to take steps to ensure that the subject of animal welfare be considered as a key competence of day 1 veterinary graduates and that some relevant teaching should be included in the core curriculum.

Dr Vallat briefly outlined the activities of the *ad hoc* Group on Veterinary Education and stated that he would ask the Chair, Dr Ron Dehaven, to carefully consider the Working Group’s comments and recommendations at the time of its next meeting (2–4 August 2011). He also noted that animal welfare was already on the list of key contents of the basic core curriculum but that more details on the teaching priorities within animal welfare may be needed.

### d. Problems with the slaughter of cattle exported from Australia to Indonesia

Dr Vallat commented that humane slaughter is a very important issue and that welfare problems related to the slaughter of cattle are not limited to Indonesia; it is fundamental to encourage the implementation of this and other OIE animal welfare standards by Members.

In order for the OIE to help improve situations of this kind, the key step is for the OIE Delegate to request OIE involvement. For example, the OIE voluntary mediation procedures could be requested by both parties to a disagreement relating to international trade.

Dr Vallat indicated that, with the agreement of the Delegate of Indonesia, the OIE would be prepared to organise a dialogue with religious leaders to raise awareness of the OIE standards for cattle slaughter, to facilitate understanding of the rationale for these standards and of how their use can help to prevent cruel treatment of animals, which he understood to be consistent with religious considerations. Dr Vallat welcomed an offer from Prof Aidaros and Dr Rahman to prepare a document as a resource to facilitate discussion of the issue of religious slaughter, at the request of OIE Members.

**e. OIE Regional animal welfare strategies**

Dr Marosi Molomo thanked Dr Vallat for the OIE's valuable initiative to call for nomination of Animal Welfare Focal Points by national OIE Delegates, and to provide training seminars, the most recent of which took place in Ethiopia in 9–11 November 2010. Dr Molomo expressed her support for the proposal to develop an OIE sub-regional animal welfare strategy in the South African Development Community (SADC), which comprises 15 countries. Some work has already been done, with the production of a concept note and the conduct of a baseline study looking at the current 'state of play' with animal welfare in the SADC members. She considered that this provided a good starting point and that there are good prospects to follow up on this. Dr Molomo, as Delegate for Lesotho, also participates in the SADC Livestock Technical Committee, which has been supportive of the idea of a sub-regional strategy.

Dr Vallat replied that the OIE supported Regional Strategies as a basis to implement the OIE global standards and pointed out that this should be the objective. In contrast, the development of new standards at the regional level is not supported. He advised that national Delegates of many developing countries do not recognise animal welfare as an immediate priority; clearly, poverty reduction and food security can present more urgent concerns in some countries.

Dr Vallat advised that OIE policy is that Delegates, as veterinarians and heads of the veterinary services, have a responsibility for the implementation of the OIE animal welfare standards and cannot ignore them. The OIE must work to convince Delegates to address this responsibility, but it must be done in a progressive manner.

Dr Vallat noted that the Middle East region, which imports many live animals, has benefited from the commitment of Australia to invest in raising awareness and strengthening infrastructure, including through the provision of financial support for the development of a regional strategy and the organisation of workshops.

With respect to the Middle East, Prof Aidaros indicated that a workshop was held recently in Bahrain to address the issue of animal welfare and praised the focal point seminar held in Lebanon in 23–25 November 2010.

The AWWG agreed to support the inclusion of a one hour session on animal welfare at all OIE Regional Commission meetings, to ensure that the issue remains on Delegates' agendas.

**f. Follow up to the OIE Global Conference on Wildlife**

Dr Wilkins asked Dr Vallat to outline the OIE's intended follow up to this conference. Dr Vallat indicated that one important action was for the OIE to enter into formal agreements with wildlife conservation organisations, with the objective of strengthening compliance with international standards for international trade in wildlife, such as the CITES requirements. He also indicated that the OIE, in collaboration with partners, would take steps to address practices such as illegal capture and trade of endangered wildlife species.

Dr Wilkins expressed concern that the Conference had not taken into account all the expertise available from Animal Welfare NGOs. Dr Vallat recognised that animal welfare was important particularly in the area of capturing wildlife and detaining them. The OIE rationale for addressing these issues is based in priority on the need to prevent risks associated with emerging diseases and to support the conservation of biodiversity.

**g. Collaboration between the European Commission and the OIE**

Dr Andrea Gavinelli confirmed the continuing European Union (EU) Commission support for the OIE's standard setting work and for the implementation of the OIE animal welfare standards. Importantly, the EU Council Regulation 1099/2009 on the protection of animals at the time of killing foresees that the OIE standards on the slaughter of animals should be taken into account when equivalency with EU requirements under this Regulation needs to be established for the purpose of imports.

Dr Gavinelli stated that he looked forward to receiving more information on the planned 3rd Global Conference on Animal Welfare in Malaysia and suggested that, amongst other sources and based on the agreement of the EU Member States, the EU contribution to the OIE Animal Health and Welfare Fund could provide support for this conference.

## 1. Working Group 9<sup>th</sup> meeting report and agreed actions; informal meeting at General Session; teleconferences

Dr Bayvel commented that the approach taken to progress the agreed annual work programme, i.e. regular teleconferences; a side-meeting during the General Session; and electronic exchange of a list of agreed actions, has been very effective.

Dr Wilkins provided an update on the progress of rabies control in Bali (Indonesia) where the provision of rabies vaccine by the Australian Government and the on-going commitment of World Society for the Protection of Animals (WSPA), working in collaboration with Indonesian authorities, have given satisfactory results in Bali to date.

Dr Bayvel drew attention to the activities of the EU Food and Veterinary Office, which has conducted fact finding visits to countries exporting to the EU within the context of the EU Council Regulation 1099/2009 on the protection of animals at the time of killing (see reference paragraph g.)

Dr Bayvel also mentioned that, following the recommendations of the 78<sup>th</sup> General Session, held in May 2010, the OIE is on its way to sign an agreement with the Global Food Safety Initiative ([www.mygfsi.com](http://www.mygfsi.com)) and is continuing discussions with GlobalGap ([www.globalgap.org](http://www.globalgap.org)).

## 2. OIE 79<sup>th</sup> General Session 2011 outcomes

The adopted Resolutions on animal welfare, food safety, veterinary education and the contribution of veterinary controls to food security were noted.

Dr Bayvel mentioned that Dr Barry O'Neil, previous President of the OIE and present OIE Delegate for New Zealand, was awarded the Gold Medal during the 79th General Session.

Dr Bayvel commented on the advice provided by Dr Vallat at the General Session on steps that would be taken to define the respective roles and responsibilities of the OIE and FAO in animal welfare. Working Group members agreed that further information on this would be most welcome.

With reference to the discussion at the General Session on the draft Chapter 7.9. (welfare in broiler chicken production systems), Members discussed the various positions of OIE Members on the draft text, notably in relation to the inclusion of specific measurables. Considering that it had not been possible to reconcile the positions of OIE Members to provide for adoption of the draft chapter, it was agreed that the Working Group would give priority to developing a draft text on General Principles for animal welfare and livestock production systems. This would be based on a draft document prepared by OIE Headquarters, with consideration to documents produced by the ICFAW among others.

The timing of presentation of the draft *Terrestrial Animal Health Code (Terrestrial Code)* texts on broiler chickens and beef cattle was also discussed and it was agreed to continue progressing these according to the established (typo) OIE standard setting procedures.

Copies of the 10th edition of the OIE *Tool for the Evaluation of Performance of Veterinary Services* (2010) were circulated for information of members and the inclusion of a competence on animal welfare was noted and endorsed.

Dr Molomo asked for some guidance on how to increase the engagement of OIE Members in the OIE's standard setting work programme for animal welfare. Dr Alejandro Thiermann noted that the African region had been much more effective in its inputs to the OIE, notably through better coordination, facilitated by the OIE Regional and sub-Regional Representations and Regional Economic Communities, especially AU-IBAR. Sarah Kahn noted that much capacity building in the realm of SPS standard setting takes place under the WTO framework but that this does not address animal welfare. She noted that African countries may find the proposed future work on animal welfare standards for working animals more directly relevant, as compared with some OIE standards adopted to date.

Prof. David Fraser commented that animal welfare standards should be seen in the light of optimising animal production. The basis for the EU provisions on animal welfare is that they represent good animal health and production.

### **3. Work of the OIE Aquatic Animal Health Standards Commission**

Prof. Neville Gregory raised a question regarding Chapter 7.2., as to whether the standard on transport of farmed fish covers the transport of wild caught fish to production sites for farming. Prof. Gregory indicated that there is a growing practice of catching wild fish and relocating them to farms where they are grown for slaughter. Examples include cod ranching (NE coast of North America), tuna caught in the north Atlantic and transferred to farms in the Mediterranean Sea, and tuna caught in the south Pacific and transferred to cages off the southern coast of Australia.

Prof. Gregory also asked if the recommendations in Chapter 7.2. are adequate to cover these translocation practices. He indicated that it could be considered as the most stressful situation for fish and that the methods used are different (e.g. towing in cages) and present different hazards.

The Working Group agreed to refer this question to the OIE Aquatic Animal Health Standards Commission (Aquatic Animals Commission) for consideration.

### **4. Veterinary education**

Dr Sarah Kahn provided an overview of the OIE activities in relation to veterinary education and drew members' attention to key documents, including the report of the OIE *ad hoc* Group on Veterinary Education (published as an annex to the report of the OIE Terrestrial Animal Health Standards Commission (Code Commission)'s February 2011 meeting); Resolution 34 of the 79<sup>th</sup> General Session on Veterinary Education; the recommendations of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Global Conference on Veterinary Education (held in Lyon, 13–14 May 2011) and the Declaration of the OIE Conference on the Role of Veterinary Statutory Bodies (held in Bamako [Mali], 14–15 April).

The Working Group made recommendations on the text dealing with animal welfare in the 'Day 1 competencies' (i.e. Items 2.4. and 2.9.).

The Working Group recommended: 1) change title of section 2.4. (delete 'regulation of') for consistency with the titles of other sections and 2) add a reference that supports the role of veterinarians in advising on ethical issues in the use of animals in contemporary society e.g. add an additional point under item 2.9.4. 'to be able to provide leadership to society on ethical considerations involved in the use, or treatment, of animals by humans.

### **5. Animals used in research and education**

Dr Bayvel summarised current work of the OIE *ad hoc* Laboratory Animal Welfare Group. He indicated that, since the adoption of Chapter 7.8., the Group has focused on the following issues: drafting new articles on air transport of animals used in research and education; veterinary training in laboratory animal medicine; regulatory testing/collaboration with the International Cooperation on Harmonization of Technical Requirements for Registration of Veterinary Medicinal Products (VICH) and the relationship with the Institute for Laboratory Animal Research (ILAR).

Dr Bayvel also mentioned the paper written by the *ad hoc* Group and coordinated by Dr Bayne on Veterinary Training. This will be published in the ILAR online Journal prior to the World Veterinary Association Conference in Cape Town. As the result of a meeting with Dr Vallat, and at his instigation, ILAR is considering submitting an application to be recognised as an OIE Collaborating Centre.

Regarding air transport, Dr Bayvel indicated that Dr Touisi from International Air Transport Association (IATA) and Dr White for Charles River have been invited to the next *ad hoc* Group meeting in July, and that Dr White would give a Seminar to OIE staff.

It is anticipated that the July meeting would be the last physical meeting of the *ad hoc* Group for the time being. Members would however continue to provide specialist advice to the OIE on laboratory animal welfare issues.

## **6. OIE *ad hoc* Group on Animal Welfare and Beef Cattle Production Systems.**

Dr Mariela Varas presented the report of the *ad hoc* Group's meeting 8–10 June 2011. The primary task of the Group was to address the comments made by OIE Members before and during the 79<sup>th</sup> General Session.

Prof. Gregory made several comments on the draft chapter (7.X.X.), as follows:

- The references to 'tongue rolling' on pages 25 and 27 should be clarified.
- On p. 30, the reference to 'high' tetanus risk should be replaced by 'higher' tetanus risk.

Regarding the references to castration, disbudding and dehorning, Prof. Gregory had some concerns about the inclusion of the phrase 'a veterinarian should be consulted on how to control pain' as he considered that veterinarians would not always be well placed to deal with this recommendation.

It was also agreed that, where possible, recommendations on analgesia should be included in the 'key animal welfare requirements' column. For chemical castration, members of the Working Group were not aware of any information on how to effectively reduce pain, and recommended that words to this effect be included in the column on 'key animal welfare requirements'.

## **7. Report of the OIE Working Group on Animal Production Food Safety**

The Working Group acknowledged the report of the Animal Production Food Safety Working Group.

Dr Ferrara mentioned that the EU Commission had requested EFSA to provide a Scientific Opinion on the use of welfare indicators for dairy cows that should be adopted by the end of 2011. She also mentioned that the EFSA Panel on Animal Health and Welfare (AHAW) launched an online public consultation on its draft Guidance on risk assessment for animal welfare ([www.efsa.europa.eu/en/consultations/call/ahaw110504.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/consultations/call/ahaw110504.htm)).

Dr Sarah Kahn gave an update on the OIE commissioned literature review on 'Linkages between Food Safety and Animal Welfare' - see discussion under 'Other Business' in this report. She indicated that this review was compiled by Dr Allison Small, on behalf of the NZ-AUS CC, and that it does not cover food security as yet. However, the issue of food security would be addressed in a subsequent draft.

## **8. Report of the OIE Working Group on Wildlife Diseases**

Dr Bayvel reported on the availability of the 2011 revision of a 2008 Australian publication on wildlife welfare and indicated that the humane control of vertebrate pests is an important topic in Australia and New Zealand.

Copies of the Australian publication will be supplied to the OIE Headquarters.

The Working Group discussed the recent OIE Conference on Wildlife, including the resolutions of that conference.

## **9. Report of the OIE *ad hoc* Group on Climate Change**

The Working Group discussed the report of the 27–28 April 2010 meeting. It was agreed to continue to monitor the issues associated with climate change.

## 10. Joint Session with Collaborating Centres

The Collaborating Centres representatives made a brief summary of their activities during 2010, as also indicated in their annual reports available at the OIE website [www.oie.int/en/our-scientific-expertise/collaborating-centres/annual-reports/](http://www.oie.int/en/our-scientific-expertise/collaborating-centres/annual-reports/). It was agreed to include a link to the Collaborating Centres annual reports under the OIE Animal Welfare web page. The list of participants to this joint session is given at [Appendix III](#).

All Centres mentioned they would be pleased to be involved in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Global Conference on Animal Welfare in 2012 and to provide any assistance required. Ms Alessandrini proposed to have a joint presentation of the Collaborating Centres during this conference.

At Dr Bayvel's request, Ms Alessandrini also provided an update on the Callisto project proposal (Companion animals multisectorial interprofessional interdisciplinary strategic think tank on zoonoses) as an example of cooperation and funding from the EU. The aim of the project is to identify knowledge and technology gaps in the management of the most important zoonoses transmitted by companion animals as well as to propose targeted actions that contribute to reduce the risk for infectious disease outbreaks associated with the keeping of companion animals in humans and food producing animals.

Dr Gallo mentioned the 2<sup>nd</sup> Meeting of Researchers that will be held in April 2012. It was agreed to invite one Member of the Working Group.

Dr Johnson, who attended the Working Group meeting personally, also commented on the NZ-AUS Collaborating Centre activities and confirmed that being an OIE Collaborating Centre has been very fruitful for the five Groups that form the NZ-AUS Collaborating Centre.

Dr Bayvel mentioned that the NZ-AUS Collaborating Centre has been supporting the OIE with the literature review on AW and FS, in both financial and human terms.

It was confirmed that all Collaborating Centres could provide services in all regions, regardless of their region of origin.

Regarding the Better Training for Safer Food (BTSF) initiative and apart from the EU-based seminars, Dr Gavinelli underlined that the workshops organised outside the EU are meant to be held mainly in countries which trade with the EU. In response, Dr Rahman suggested that it could be a good strategy for the EU to consider training for future trading partners such as India or China.

It was agreed that Dr Mariela Varas and Ms Alessandrini would discuss further website opportunities to exchange information between the three CCs.

At the subsequent follow-up meeting, held in conjunction with the Human Society Association "Centenary International Conference", the following additional actions were agreed:

- Collaborating Centres will advise each other of proposed attendance at international conferences, which might provide an opportunity for face to face meetings.
- The proposed AWWG amendments to the OIE Rules on Collaborating Centres will be provided, for information, to the three existing Centres after consideration by the OIE Council.
- Collaborating Centres will advise each other of twinning applications being considered.

## 11. Other business

### • **Future work of *ad hoc* Groups on Animal Welfare and Livestock Production Systems**

The Working Group had a discussion on the way forward with these standards. It was agreed to draft a chapter on Guiding Principles for animal welfare in livestock production systems, to be provided to the Code Commission meeting in September 2011. This work will involve Prof. Fraser and Drs Wilkins, Rahman, Mirabito and Guyonnet, with Prof. Fraser taking the lead.

It was noted that the first meeting of the ad hoc Group on Welfare in Dairy Cattle Production Systems would be postponed until further notice, to allow for a clearer understanding of OIE Members' expectations, including on the broiler and beef cattle chapters.

- **Third Global Conference on Animal Welfare**

The chosen theme for the conference will be: *Implementing the OIE standards – addressing regional perspectives*. It was agreed that Dr Bayvel, Dr Wilkins and Dr Mariela Varas would provide a draft Concept Note for 31 July 2011. Dr Gavinelli commented on the need to focus on regional issues to develop synergies amongst OIE Members.

- **OIE Regional Animal Welfare Strategy: update on the situation of each Region**

Dr Bayvel mentioned that the Regional Animal Welfare Strategy (RAWS) in the Asia, Far East and Oceania (AFEO) is well advanced and that the RAWS-Coordination Group held its first meeting in April. He indicated that it was agreed to hold the second meeting of the Coordination Group back to back with the Animal Welfare Focal Point seminar that is planned for November 2011 in Tokyo.

Dr Molomo commented on the proposal to develop an animal welfare sub-regional strategy in the SADC region, which includes 15 Member Countries. The Concept Note has been circulated and will be submitted to the SADC meeting in September for endorsement and then to the OIE Regional Commission in the next General Session.

Prof. Aidaros stated that, during the Focal Point seminar for the Middle East, which was held in Lebanon in November 2010, it was agreed to draft a concept note on a regional strategy. It was agreed that Dr Mariela Varas and Prof Aidaros would contact the Regional Representation for an update on this matter.

Regarding the situation in the Americas, Dr Mariela Varas mentioned that a Concept Note has been circulated and will be submitted to the Regional Commission in due course.

Dr Gavinelli mentioned the EC is willing to support a strategy at European level and that he looks forward to attending the Animal Welfare Focal Point seminar planned for March 2012 in Kiev.

The Working Group encouraged all OIE Regions to continue to give priority to strategy development.

- **Animal welfare standards for reptiles**

The AWWG noted correspondence between OIE Headquarters and the Delegate of Switzerland. Unfortunately, due to other priorities, the AWWG was not in a position to further consider this matter.

- **FAO electronic consultation on dog population management**

Dr Mariela Varas mentioned that FAO held an Electronic Consultation on Dog Population Management (DPM) options with special emphasis on animal welfare and health, on 13 September–12 November 2010. The objectives were to review the current state of knowledge on DPM options and practices and to analyse the current state of implementation of the OIE standards on stray dog population control. FAO then held a meeting in March, along with WSPA and the IZC (Istituto Zooprofilattico Sperimentale dell'Abruzzo e del Molise 'G. Caporale' di Teramo), where the objective was to raise key points to deal with DPM and perhaps to provide guidance on how to implement the relevant OIE standard. It was acknowledged that many of the points identified are covered in the *Terrestrial Code* Chapter 7.7. (stray dog population control). The FAO report is likely to be released in November 2011.

- **FAO electronic consultation – working animals; future OIE standard on working animals**

Drs Mariela Varas, Rahman and Gavinelli attended the meeting held by FAO and The Brooke following the electronic consultation on the Role, Impact and Welfare of Working Animals. They mentioned some of the recommendations of the meeting, which will include recommending that the OIE draft a standard on the welfare of working animals.

The Working Group acknowledged this statement, and it was decided to wait for FAO's report. An *ad hoc* group on working animals may be anticipated to start working in the second semester 2012.

- **Literature review of animal welfare and food safety**

The Working Group gratefully acknowledged the work of Dr A. Small, commissioned by the NZ-AUS CC.

Mr Mirabito commented that he had some problems with the structure of the report. He suggested to better formalise the analysis by, for example, including a cross-table with the different criteria for animal welfare and food safety; and also adding information on where data are lacking, as well as where data exist. A review by members of his organisation could also be helpful as he's not, himself, specialist of food safety.

Dr Vincent Guyonnet advised that he was aware of additional references on poultry welfare and food safety, e.g. housing and shell quality, and that he would provide these.

Prof. Fraser stated that he did not agree with the approach to the review. Specifically, he considered that the concept of animal welfare used in the review should be more closely aligned with the OIE definition of animal welfare. Animal health and animal welfare interact/overlap much more closely than as presented in the diagram shown in the paper. Prof. Fraser suggested that the paper be retitled, e.g. 'The impact of animal health and welfare on the transmission of foodborne pathogens and zoonotic diseases'.

Prof. Gregory recommended that additional issues be covered in the paper, i.e.:

- Use of post mortem inspection criteria for assessing animal welfare
- Effect of pre-slaughter stress on meat pH and survival of pathogens such as FMD
- Significance of trauma and bruising for microbial survival
- Importance of zoonoses that can be transmitted by meat that have an animal welfare impact.

Dr Rahman recommended that the paper deal with the issue of consumption of non-traditional animal products (e.g. bush meat) and risk of transmission of zoonotic diseases via this route.

The International Trade Department of the OIE will provide the draft report, together with the AWWG comments, to the Animal Production Food Safety Working Group, at its meeting in November 2011.

- **Animal welfare risk assessment – teleconference with Dr A. Sheridan**

Dr Sheridan introduced his paper with the comment that animal welfare is a human construct, it is not objective. Risk communication is critical. EFSA deals with risk assessment but does not provide a practical and pragmatic approach to help resolve problems in the context of animal trade across borders. Dr Sheridan therefore conducted a 'road test' on how the *Terrestrial Code* chapter on slaughter fits with Australian abattoir procedures.

Dr Sheridan explained that he visited an Australian abattoir and made a hazard assessment, based on the *Terrestrial Code* chapter, to see if this was consistent with the expectations of the Australian public for animal welfare. Charts included in the paper provided to the OIE show the risks with both uncontrolled and controlled hazards. He recommended that the topic be addressed by the OIE, using the *ad hoc* group methodology.

Dr Wilkins questioned what interaction there would be between the proposed *ad hoc* group and the Regional Strategy in Asia, Far East and Oceania (AFEO), as for the moment, there are no comparable regional strategies in other regions. Dr Sheridan agreed that the proposed approach should be generally applicable, not restricted to the AFEO region.

Prof. Fraser commented on the use of risk assessment to determine compliance with animal welfare standards at slaughter plants and stated that a similar approach had been undertaken in Canada. He recommended that this approach be studied and standardised, with the objective of making it more user-friendly. He also considered that the development of peer reviewed scientific literature would be necessary to support general acceptance by OIE Members. Dr Sheridan replied that he recognised the need to produce scientific papers supporting the approach and planned to present the proposed work to the Australian Centre of Excellence on Risk Assessment in future.

Dr Rahman encouraged Dr Sheridan to consider the slaughter of working animals within the scope of the paper, especially given the involvement of developing countries in the Regional Strategy for the AFEO region.

Dr Bayvel invited Dr Sheridan to explain how his proposal fits with the work of EFSA on animal welfare risk assessment. Dr Sheridan explained that his work was rather different, as he saw a need to work with stakeholder groups, with a view to establishing an 'acceptable' approach to the treatment of animals and that this was best established by working with stakeholders, rather than using a 'top down' approach or an entirely 'science based' approach, as done by EFSA.

Prof. Gregory commented that Dr Sheridan's proposal is commendable as a research goal, noting that the need to develop systems for risk assessment that are aimed at applying the OIE animal welfare standards is recognised.

The Working Group did not support adoption of Dr Sheridan's proposal because there was insufficient clarity about the goals and practical outcomes of the analytical approach. When asked about how the practical example on slaughter would be developed, it appeared from Dr Sheridan's reply that it would mainly address risk identification. However, the Working Group considered that the risks associated with livestock slaughter has already been well identified in the OIE standard on livestock slaughter, which has already been included in the *Terrestrial Code* for several years.

Noting that Dr Sheridan's proposal aimed to address the expectations of stakeholders on livestock welfare at the time of slaughter, the Working Group questioned if risk analysis was the most appropriate technique to use. As a technique, risk analysis was valuable in identifying risks and how to manage them but it may be less valuable in addressing the expectations of stakeholders. Additionally, risk communication with stakeholders is dependent on the cultural context and situation and it does not seem to be appropriate to address both this topic and the identification of hazards and evaluation of risk management options in the same project, as the latter topic mainly relies on approaches based on scientific and technical risk assessment.

Prof. Fraser stated that he would be pleased to see scientific publications that could be used as a basis for standard development in the future.

- **Fifth Pan Commonwealth Veterinary Association Conference (CVA) /Ghana Report**

Dr Bayvel reported that the conference was a very successful event with internationally recognized speakers and strong OIE involvement. Dr Gavinelli agreed with Dr Bayvel and stated that feedback should be used to support more cooperation and assistance in Africa. Dr Rahman was congratulated on being elected to the position of CVA President.

- **Global Fund**

Contributions from OIE Member Countries to the World Fund were mentioned, as well as the contribution from the EC for Global conferences.

- **Collaborating Centres applications (Mexico/Sweden)**

The Working Group acknowledged the reply sent by the OIE to these applications. It was agreed that Drs Fraser and Bayvel would work on a new document to be provided to the OIE Council at its meeting in October 2011, as mentioned above (see 'Meeting with the Director General').

- **Technical Item 2013**

It was agreed to consider proposing Wildlife Management and Trade as a Technical Item for the OIE 81<sup>st</sup> General Session in 2013 and that Dr Wilkins would prepare a presentation on this subject for the next AWWG meeting.

- **Disaster management**

Dr Wilkins made a presentation on WSPA's involvement in disaster relief and management and provided the Working Group with a detailed picture of the work in Haiti following the massive earthquake in early 2010.

The Working Group acknowledged the need to provide guidelines on this matter. Dr Susanne Munstermann, OIE Scientific and Technical Department, reported that the OIE awaited the outcomes of the FAO electronic consultation and an upcoming meeting on this subject to define how to intervene. She also drew the attention of members to the very useful Guidelines published by LEGS (Livestock emergency guidelines and standards).

Dr Bayvel also referred to the Marjan Institute as another potential partner in this area.

- **Emerging and Strategic Issues: Reducing suffering in fisheries – report from Fishcount.org.uk**

The Working Group noted this excellent report and referred it to the OIE Aquatic Animals Commission and relevant FAO contact person for review.

- **Avian influenza stamping out systems**

Dr Mariela Varas referred to the extensive documentation received by OIE headquarters on this subject. It was agreed that Dr Varas will liaise with Prof. Gregory to finalize correspondence of this issue.

- **Animal welfare and trade: other issues**

Dr Gavinelli referred to the ongoing discussions with OIE to hold a second Animal Welfare and Trade Colloquium, as a follow-up to the meeting held in Brussels in 2009.

Dr Bayvel summarised the current situation regarding the export of Australian cattle to Indonesia. The OIE has received letters from Animals Australia and ICFAW regarding potential cruel treatment of cattle at abattoirs in Indonesia.

Prof. Gregory presented some details of the problem, stating that the problems shown in the DVD had been filmed in small slaughterhouses, mostly slaughtering small numbers of cattle (2–3 head), using Halal techniques. In Java and Sumatra, there are some 4,000 slaughter premises. The animals exported from Australia go to feedlots, from which they are purchased in very small numbers and slaughtered in small abattoirs. Dr Rahman commented that this situation applies in many developing countries. Slaughterhouses are small and controls over food safety and animal welfare generally fall short of international standards.

The Working Group discussed steps that the OIE could take to help to improve this situation. Members considered that the OIE could make a valuable contribution by establishing a dialogue with religious leaders to raise awareness of the OIE standards for humane slaughter.

Prof. Aidaros proposed that he and Dr Rahman develop a paper setting out some of the key recommendations of the Koran in respect of animal welfare. Dr Sarah Kahn asked Dr El-Saleh (intern from Saudi Arabia, temporarily located at the OIE) to collaborate in this work.

Dr Gavinelli proposed to make OIE Members aware of the outcomes of the EU-funded research project Diarel, which aims to facilitate dialogue between religious authorities and stakeholders (<http://www.dialrel.eu/welcome>).

- **Request from Thailand for modification of the OIE standards for poultry stunning and slaughter**

Prof. Gregory summarised information provided by Thailand arising from discussion held at the first meeting of the RAWs AFEO Coordination Group held in Bangkok in April.

Thailand has requested reconsideration of the OIE standards for electrical stunning of poultry when slaughtering according to religious requirements (i.e. where the stunning should not be lethal). The OIE standard does not address the issue of applying a stun without killing the animal; therefore it is open to the operator to choose a method that provides satisfactory results. The submission from Thailand outlined the efforts made to find a method that satisfies requirements for animal welfare, religious slaughter and meat quality.

The Working Group appreciated the Thai submission. Members noted that there is provision in Chapter 7.5. for stunning using a lower current than that recommended in the tables in Article 7.5.7. point 3 (b). However, this may be seen as conflicting with the title of the tables, which refer to 'minimum current'. The Working Group asked Prof. Gregory, in collaboration with other experts in poultry slaughter, to advise if it would be appropriate to make provision for the use of lower currents in combination with 200–400 Hz frequency. If so, this point could be added to the table on 'minimum current for stunning poultry when using high frequencies' in Article 7.5.7. point 3 (b).

## **12. Work programme 2012**

Members reviewed the current work programme with the view to updating it for 2012. It was agreed that Dr Mariela Varas and Dr Bayvel would circulate the draft proposed 2012 Work Programme by 1 November 2011.

All Members were encouraged to give careful attention to the draft work programme to ensure that it includes all key initiatives and regional priorities.

## **13. Dates of next meeting**

It was agreed that the next meeting would be held on 26–28 June 2012.

A Working Group teleconference will be scheduled in early January to provide input to the winter meetings of the Code and Aquatic Animals Commissions.

---

Appendices/...

**MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE**  
**Paris, 21–23 June 2011**

**List of participants**

**MEMBERS OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP**

---

**Dr David Bayvel (Chair)**

Director Animal Welfare  
 MAF NZ  
 Box 2526  
 Wellington  
 NEW ZEALAND  
 Tel.: (64-4) 8940368  
 Fax: (64-4) 8940747  
[bayveld@maf.govt.nz](mailto:bayveld@maf.govt.nz)

**Prof. Hassan Aidaros**

Professor of Hygiene and Preventive  
 Medicine. Faculty of Veterinary Medicine  
 Banha Univ.  
 5 Mossadak st  
 12311 Dokki  
 Cairo  
 EGYPT  
 Tel.: (20212) 218 51 66  
[Haidaros@netscape.net](mailto:Haidaros@netscape.net)

**Prof. David Fraser**

Professor and Chair in Animal Welfare  
 Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and  
 Centre for Applied Ethics  
 University of British Columbia  
 2357 Main Mall-Suite 248  
 Vancouver V6T 1Z4  
 CANADA  
 Tel.: (1-604) 822 2040  
 Fax.: (1-604) 822 4400  
[dfraser@interchg.ubc.ca](mailto:dfraser@interchg.ubc.ca)

**Dr Andrea Gavinelli (Day 2&3)**

Head of Unit  
 European Commission  
 Directorate General Health and  
 Consumers  
 Unit D5 – Animal Welfare,  
 Rue Froissart 101 – 6/168  
 1040 Brussels  
 BELGIUM  
 Tel.: (32-2) 2966426  
 Fax: (32-2)2979573  
[Andrea.Gavinelli@ec.europa.eu](mailto:Andrea.Gavinelli@ec.europa.eu)

**Prof. Neville Gregory**

Representing IMS  
 Royal Veterinary College  
 Hawkshead Lane - Hatfield  
 Hertfordshire - AL9 7TA  
 UNITED KINGDOM  
[ngregory@rvc.ac.uk](mailto:ngregory@rvc.ac.uk)

**Dr Marosi Molomo**

Director of Livestock Services  
 Department of Livestock Services  
 Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security  
 PO Box A 82  
 Maseru 100  
 LESOTHO  
 Tel.: (266) 22317284  
 Fax: (266) 22311500  
[marosi\\_molomo@yahoo.com](mailto:marosi_molomo@yahoo.com)

**Dr Sira Abdul Rahman**

Retd. Dean Bangalore Veterinary College  
 No 123, 7<sup>th</sup> B Main Road  
 4th Block(West)  
 Jayanagar, Bangalore 560 011  
 INDIA  
 Tel.: (91-80) 6532168  
 Fax: (91-80) 6635210  
[shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in](mailto:shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in)

**Dr David Wilkins**

Secretary  
 ICFAW  
 c/o WSPA, 222 Grays Inn Road  
 London WC1X 8HB  
 UNITED KINGDOM  
 Tel.: (44) 20 72 39 05 00  
 Fax: (44) 20 72 39 06 53  
[wilkinsvet@btinternet.com](mailto:wilkinsvet@btinternet.com)

**OTHER PARTICIPANTS**

---

**Mr Luc Mirabito**

Chef de projet "Bien être animal" -  
 Representing IDF  
 Institut de l'Elevage  
 149, rue de Bercy  
 75013 Paris  
 FRANCE  
 Tel.: 33 - (0)1 40 04 52 35  
[luc.mirabito@inst-elevage.asso.fr](mailto:luc.mirabito@inst-elevage.asso.fr)

**Dr Maria Ferrara (Day 1)**

European Commission  
 DG SANCO  
 Unit G3 Animal Welfare  
 Office F101 06/172  
 B-1049 Brussels  
 BELGIUM  
 Tel.: (32-2) 29 87629  
 Fax: (32-2) 29 63615  
[Maria.Ferrara@ec.europa.eu](mailto:Maria.Ferrara@ec.europa.eu)

**Dr Vincent Guyonnet**

Representing IEC  
 3356 County Road 27  
 Lyn, ON K0E 1M0  
 CANADA  
 Tel.: 1-613-341-2043  
 Fax: 1-613-341-2014  
[vincent@internationalegg.com](mailto:vincent@internationalegg.com)

**Dr Alex Thiermann**

President of the Terrestrial Animal Health  
 Standards Commission  
 OIE  
[a.thiermann@oie.int](mailto:a.thiermann@oie.int)

## OIE HEADQUARTERS

---

**Dr Bernard Vallat**

Director General  
OIE  
12, rue de Prony  
75017 Paris  
FRANCE  
Tel.: 33 - (0)1 44 15 18 88  
Fax: 33 - (0)1 42 67 09 87  
[ois@oie.int](mailto:ois@oie.int)

**Dr Sarah Kahn**

Head of Department  
International Trade Department  
OIE  
Tel.: 33 - (0)1 44.15.18.92  
Fax: 33 - (0)1 42.67.09.87  
[s.kahn@oie.int](mailto:s.kahn@oie.int)

**Dr Susanne Munstermann**

Chargée de mission  
Scientific and technical Department  
OIE  
[s.munstermann@oie.int](mailto:s.munstermann@oie.int)

**Dr Wim Pelgrim**

Chargé de mission  
International Trade Department  
OIE  
[w.pelgrim@oie.int](mailto:w.pelgrim@oie.int)

**Dr Mariela Varas**

Chargée de mission  
International Trade Department  
OIE  
Tel.: 33 - (0)1 44.15.18.97  
Fax: 33 - (0)1 42.67.09.87  
[m.varas@oie.int](mailto:m.varas@oie.int)

**Dr Leonardo James Vinco**

International Trade Department  
OIE  
Tel.: 33 - (0)1 44.15.19.68  
Fax: 33 - (0)1 42.67.09.87  
[l.vinco@oie.int](mailto:l.vinco@oie.int)

**Dr Usamah A. El-Saleh**

International Trade Department  
OIE  
[u.sabass@oie.int](mailto:u.sabass@oie.int)

**MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE  
Paris, 23–25 June 2010**

---

**Adopted agenda**

Introduction and priorities / Dr Kahn

Introduction of participants and welcome to Dr Guyonnet / Dr Bayvel

Administrative arrangements / Dr Kahn

23 June 2011 - 2:00 pm to 3:30 pm: Joint Session with Representatives of OIE Animal Welfare Collaborating Centres

- 1. Working Group 9<sup>th</sup> Meeting Report, agreed Actions, Informal Meeting at GS & Teleconferences**
- 2. OIE General Session 2011 Outcomes**
  - General Session Report/ Resolutions
  - Resolution on Animal Welfare
  - Other Issues Raised: adoption of Chapter 7.9. on Animal Welfare and Broiler Chicken Production Systems
  - PVS
- 3. Work of the OIE Aquatic Animal Health Standards Commission**
- 4. Report of the *ad hoc* Group on Veterinary Education and 2nd Global conference on Veterinary Education 13–14 May 2011 – Feedback from Dr Kahn**
- 5. Report and on-going work of the *ad hoc* Group on Laboratory Animal Welfare**
  - Air Transport: New article
  - Veterinary Training
  - Regulatory Testing: collaboration with VICH
- 6. Report of the *ad hoc* Group on Animal Welfare and Beef Cattle Production Systems**
- 7. Report of the Working Group on Food Safety**
- 8. Report of the Working Group on Wildlife Diseases**
- 9. Report of the *ad hoc* Group on Climate Change**
- 10. Joint session with Collaborating Centres**

**11. Other Business**

- Future work of *ad hoc* Groups on Animal Welfare and Livestock Production Systems
- 3<sup>rd</sup> Global Conference on Animal Welfare – planning
- OIE Regional Animal Welfare Strategy: update on the situation of each Region
- RAWs/AFEO Coordination Group report
- OIE Technical Mission to Korea (Rep. of)
- Animal Welfare standards for reptiles (Dr. Wyss' email)
- FAO electronic consultations: Dog Population Management and Working Animals
- Future OIE work on Working Animals
- Animal Welfare and Food Safety/ Food Security- Literature review
- Animal Welfare Risk assessment (Dr Sheridan's paper/possible teleconference)
- Ghana report
- Global fund
- Collaborating Centres applications (Mexico/Sweden)
- Annual Reports of Collaborating Centres (Italy, Chile/Uruguay, NZ/Australia)
- Twinning opportunities
- Animal Welfare Focal Point Seminars
- ILAR – report on the meeting between Dr Vallat and Drs Joubert/MacArthur Clark.
- Technical Item for 2012
- OIE *ad hoc* group on Disaster Relief and Management
- Disaster Management presentation (Dr Wilkins)
- Emerging and Strategic Issues: “Reducing suffering in fisheries” report from *Fishcount.org.uk*
- PVS
- Compact Europe
- Intra OIE communications
- Request from Thailand for modification of the OIE standards for poultry stunning and slaughter
- Animal welfare and Trade: diverse issues

**12. Work programme 2011**

**13. Meeting report**

**14. Next Meeting**

---

JOINT MEETING BETWEEN THE ANIMAL WELFARE WORKING GROUP AND  
THE ANIMAL WELFARE COLLABORATION CENTRES

Paris, 23 June 2011

List of participants

MEMBERS OF THE OIE ANIMAL WELFARE WORKING GROUP

---

**Dr David Bayvel (Chair)**

Director Animal Welfare  
MAF NZ  
Box 2526  
Wellington  
NEW ZEALAND  
Tel.: (64-4) 8940368  
Fax: (64-4) 8940747  
[bayveld@maf.govt.nz](mailto:bayveld@maf.govt.nz)

**Prof. Hassan Aidaros**

Professor of Hygiene and Preventive  
Medicine. Faculty of Veterinary Medicine  
Banha Univ.  
5 Mossadak st  
12311 Dokki  
Cairo  
EGYPT  
Tel.: (20212) 218 51 66  
[Haidaros@netscape.net](mailto:Haidaros@netscape.net)

**Prof. David Fraser**

Professor and Chair in Animal Welfare  
Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and  
Centre for Applied Ethics  
University of British Columbia  
2357 Main Mall-Suite 248  
Vancouver V6T 1Z4  
CANADA  
Tel.: (1-604) 822 2040  
Fax: (1-604) 822 4400  
[dfraser@interchg.ubc.ca](mailto:dfraser@interchg.ubc.ca)

**Dr Andrea Gavinelli**

Head of Unit  
European Commission  
Directorate General Health and  
Consumers  
Unit D5 – Animal Welfare,  
Rue Froissart 101 – 6/168  
1040 Brussels  
BELGIUM  
Tel.: (32-2) 2966426  
Fax: (32-2)2979573  
[Andrea.Gavinelli@ec.europa.eu](mailto:Andrea.Gavinelli@ec.europa.eu)

**Prof. Neville Gregory**

Representing IMS  
Royal Veterinary College  
Hawkshead Lane - Hatfield  
Hertfordshire - AL9 7TA  
UNITED KINGDOM  
[ngregory@rvc.ac.uk](mailto:ngregory@rvc.ac.uk)

**Dr Marosi Molomo**

Director of Livestock Services  
Department of Livestock Services  
Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security  
PO Box A 82  
Maseru 100  
LESOTHO  
Tel.: (266) 22317284  
Fax: (266) 22311500  
[marosi\\_molomo@yahoo.com](mailto:marosi_molomo@yahoo.com)

**Dr Sira Abdul Rahman**

Retd. Dean Bangalore Veterinary College  
No 123, 7<sup>th</sup> B Main Road  
4th Block(West)  
Jayanagar, Bangalore 560 011  
INDIA  
Tel.: (91-80) 6532168  
Fax: (91-80) 6635210  
[shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in](mailto:shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in)

**Dr David Wilkins**

Secretary  
ICFAW  
c/o WSPA, 222 Grays Inn Road  
London WC1X 8HB  
UNITED KINGDOM  
Tel: (44) 20 72 39 05 00  
Fax: (44) 20 72 39 06 53  
[wilkinsvet@btinternet.com](mailto:wilkinsvet@btinternet.com)

## COLLABORATING CENTRES

---

### **Dr Carmen Gallo**

Universidad Austral de Chile  
Independencia 641  
Casilla 567, Valdivia  
CHILE  
Tel.: (56-7) 63.221.690  
Fax: (56-7) 63.221.766  
[cgallo@uach.cl](mailto:cgallo@uach.cl)

### **Ms Barbara Alessandrini**

Istituto Zooprofilattico Sperimentale  
dell'Abruzzo e del Molise 'G. Caporale'  
Via Campo Boario  
64100 Teramo  
ITALY  
Tel.: (39-0861) 33.2676  
Fax: (39-0861) 33.22.51  
['b.alessandrini@izs.it'](mailto:'b.alessandrini@izs.it')

### **Dr Stella Maris Huertas C**

Instituto de Biociencias, Facultad de  
Veterinaria,  
Universidad de la Republica O. del  
Uruguay  
Lasplaces 1550 CP 11300,  
URUGUAY  
Tel.: (598-2) 628 3505;  
Fax: (598 2) 628 0130;  
[stellamaris32@hotmail.com](mailto:stellamaris32@hotmail.com)

### **Dr Craig Johnson (in person)**

Associate Professor of Veterinary Neurophysiology  
Animal Welfare Science and Bioethics  
Centre Institute of Veterinary  
Massey University  
Private Bag 11 222  
4442 Palmerston North  
New Zealand  
Tel.: (64-6) 356 9099  
Fax: (64-6) 350 3456  
[C.B.Johnson@massey.ac.nz](mailto:C.B.Johnson@massey.ac.nz)

## OIE HEADQUARTERS

---

### **Dr Sarah Kahn**

Head of Department  
International Trade Department  
World Organisation for Animal Health  
OIE  
[s.kahn@oie.int](mailto:s.kahn@oie.int)

### **Dr Wim Pelgrim**

Chargé de mission  
International Trade Department  
World Organisation for Animal Health  
OIE  
[w.pelgrim@oie.int](mailto:w.pelgrim@oie.int)

### **Dr Mariela Varas**

Chargée de mission  
International Trade Department  
World Organisation for Animal Health  
OIE  
[m.varas@oie.int](mailto:m.varas@oie.int)

### **Dr Leonardo Vinco**

International Trade Department  
OIE  
[l.vinco@oie.int](mailto:l.vinco@oie.int)

### **Dr Usamah A. El-Saleh**

International Trade Department  
OIE  
[u.sabass@oie.int](mailto:u.sabass@oie.int)

---

© **World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE), 2011**

This document has been prepared by specialists convened by the World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE). Pending adoption by the World Assembly of Delegates, the views expressed herein can only be construed as those of these specialists.

All OIE publications are protected by international copyright law. Extracts may be copied, reproduced, translated, adapted or published in journals, documents, books, electronic media and any other medium destined for the public, for information, educational or commercial purposes, provided prior written permission has been granted by the OIE.

The designations and denominations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the OIE concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers and boundaries.

The views expressed in signed articles are solely the responsibility of the authors. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by the OIE in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned.