



Original: English
February 2004

REPORT OF THE SECOND MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE

Paris, 26-27 February 2004

**(Extract from the June-July 2004 meeting of the
Bureau of the OIE Terrestrial Animal Health Standards Commission)**

The OIE Working Group on Animal Welfare held its second meeting at OIE Headquarters on 26-27 February 2004.

The members of the Working Group and other participants are listed in Appendix A. The Agenda adopted is given in Appendix B. Dr D. Bayvel chaired the meeting.

On behalf of Dr B. Vallat, Director General of the OIE, Dr D. Wilson, Head of the International Trade Department, welcomed the members of the Working Group and thanked them for agreeing to continue their work on this important mandate of the OIE. He also welcomed Dr D. Wilkins as an observer to the Working Group; Dr Wilkins explained the role of the organisation of which he is secretary, the International Coalition for Farm Animal Welfare (ICFAW). Dr Wilkins regretted that he was only able to participate in the meeting on the first day. Dr Wilson noted that Dr I.M. Reda could not be present due to illness.

1. Animal Welfare Conference

The Working Group strongly believed that the OIE's Global Animal Welfare Conference which had just concluded had achieved its aims, and that the formula of stakeholder participation had been successful. It believed that future conferences should be more narrowly focused and perhaps aligned with particular interests or needs at a regional level.

The Working Group believed that the success of the Conference was in a large part due to the planning of the Steering Committee, and the efforts of the OIE Central Office staff in the organisation and running of the Conference. From its viewpoint, the principal Conference outcomes had been:

- an enhanced understanding of the OIE's mandate, procedures, work to date and aims regarding animal welfare by a diverse group of participants, some of which had never before dealt with the OIE;
- an appreciation of the challenges of animal welfare as a global issue;
- a very strong endorsement of OIE's leadership role in animal welfare;
- the initiation of a positive dialogue.

Appendix XIV (contd)

The Working Group emphasised the need for the OIE to enhance the understanding of Delegates during the General Session of the OIE's animal welfare work. A process has been established and the first steps towards animal welfare guidelines taken, on a continuous improvement basis.

The Working Group made the following comments on the outcomes of syndicate group discussions not involving an existing ad hoc Group:

a) Animal welfare in the veterinary curriculum

- The Working Group recommended that under-graduate veterinary curricula and continuing education programmes include animal welfare and ethics.
- The Working Group recommended that the OIE consult with the World Veterinary Association (WVA) and other international veterinary and scientific associations, to ensure that suitable resource material is made available to Delegates for use in veterinary curricula within Member Countries.

b) Research

- The Working Group encouraged the animal welfare *ad hoc* Groups to identify any research topics needing to be investigated to provide scientific information regarding issues under their consideration.
- The Working Group recommended that the OIE make available to research providers the above topics to encourage funding organisations to support relevant and appropriate research.

c) Animal welfare and international trade

The Working Group recommended that the OIE and the World Trade Organization draft a document clarifying the international legal issues and treaty obligations associated with animal welfare and international trade.

d) Companion animals

- The Working Group recommended that the OIE examine in due course the applicability to companion animals of the guidelines being developed for animals in agriculture and aquaculture.
- The Working Group noted that some Conference participants had highlighted the animal / human health and animal welfare importance of effective stray dog control with particular reference to rabies.

e) Wildlife and animals in research

- The Working Group recommended that the OIE liaise closely with relevant international organisations when developing animal welfare guidelines dealing with wildlife and animals in research.
- The Working Group recommended that the OIE Working Group on Wildlife Diseases consider animal welfare aspects as well as diseases of wildlife in its future work.

f) Communications

- Noting that the Conference had encouraged greater transparency in the OIE's deliberations, the Working Group believed that the OIE may need to examine its communication and decision-making processes to ensure that consultation on animal welfare issues be as efficient as possible; the Working Group recommended that the OIE make public at an earlier stage reports of Working Group and *ad hoc* Group meetings; the Working Group also noted the importance of the OIE publicising upcoming meetings of *ad hoc* Groups to enhance stakeholder input.

Appendix XIV (contd)

- The Working Group recommended that the OIE develop a long-term communication strategy for animal welfare.
- The Working Group recommended that the OIE communicate its long-term animal welfare strategy to enhance stakeholder understanding and participation.
- The Working Group recommended that the OIE develop and advise a single contact point for its animal welfare programme.
- The Working Group recommended that Delegates communicate within their countries on upcoming OIE animal welfare issues and ensure that relevant stakeholders are included in the preparation of country comments on draft guidelines, etc.
- The Working Group recommended that stakeholders keep their Delegates informed on their activities and that all communications with the OIE should involve the relevant Delegate.
- The Working Group noted the need for improved regional awareness of new OIE standards using dialogue with local stakeholders, specialised conferences and Regional Commissions.
- The Working Group recommended that the OIE forge a strong relationship with key international scientific organisations, e.g. the International Society for Applied Ethology (ISAE), the International Society for Animal Hygiene (ISAH).

2. Reports of *ad hoc* Group meetings

The Working Group recalled that the reports of the 2003 meetings of the four animal welfare *ad hoc* Groups had been circulated to Working Group members for comment, prior to being submitted to the Code Commission. The Code Commission had endorsed the reports at its December 2003 meeting and circulated them for the comment of Member Countries. The Working Group commended the four *ad hoc* Groups on their excellent work to date.

The Working Group reiterated the importance of aquatic animal welfare being addressed as a matter of priority, through an *ad hoc* Group being assembled to address rearing, transport and slaughter issues for aquatic animals.

The Working Group then discussed each of the reports in the light of the outcomes of the Conference and made proposals for the *ad hoc* Groups to consider at their next meetings:

a) General

- The Working Group noted the need for harmonised definitions and recommended that the chairs of all the *ad hoc* Groups work towards a single list for inclusion in the *Terrestrial Code*.
- The Working Group strongly supported the principle that animal handlers be competent and that training of such operators was an important factor in animal welfare, and recommended that more specific requirements for competence be written through coordination with AATA/IATA.
- The Working Group recommended that expertise on specific issues be added to the OIE expertise database for use by *ad hoc* Groups and by Member Countries.

b) Slaughter for human consumption

The Working Group noted that the *ad hoc* Group had considered the important issue of religious slaughter and that it had recognised that the guiding principles applied equally to religious slaughter; the Working Group encouraged the *ad hoc* Group to continue to develop specific guidelines to address the issue.

Appendix XIV (contd)c) Killing for disease control purposes

- The Working Group supported the decision of the *ad hoc* Group that procedures requiring specific commercial equipment should not be included in OIE guidelines; references to such procedures could be made.
- The Working Group noted the importance of the testing and updating of national contingency plans.

d) Land and sea transport

- The Working Group encouraged the *ad hoc* Groups to more tightly specify fitness to travel issues (including pregnancy considerations).
- The Working Group recommended that the issue of ‘roll-on-roll-off’ transport be further addressed, especially with regard to the duration of a journey.

3. Generic guiding principles on animal welfare

The Working Group considered again its generic guiding principles proposed for adoption at the General Session, and supported their adoption.

The Working Group considered that the Article on the scientific basis for guidelines contained some inconsistencies and redundancies, and could be strengthened; it agreed a revised text for this article which would be submitted for adoption. The Working Group considered that the ethical basis for guidelines was adequately covered in the *Terrestrial Code* and in the generic guiding principles, and that this specific text could be deleted. The revised text is at Appendix C.

4. Aquaculture animal welfare

The Working Group discussed a work programme for aquaculture animal welfare and how best it could be implemented. It considered that an *ad hoc* Group or Groups should be set up specifically to address aquaculture animal welfare, rather than for aquaculture to be added to the scope of the work of existing *ad hoc* Groups; the Working Group supported this approach.

It was decided that Professor Hastein would propose to the other members terms of reference to cover production, transport and slaughter issues for freshwater, saltwater and ornamental fish, and appropriate membership of the *ad hoc* Group(s).

5. Other business

The Working Group discussed its future membership needs. It noted positively the establishment of an international coalition of animal welfare organisations, ICAFW. It welcomed the participation of Dr Wilkins as an observer, due to the expertise he brought to its discussions and his demonstrated ability to communicate with a broad range of animal welfare NGOs. It recommended to the Director General that he become a full member of the Working Group.

The Working Group is also seeking direct participation of an expert drawn from animal industries with expertise in animal transport, production and slaughter, and with good communication networks with such industries. The Working Group asked the Director General to write to relevant international organisations, seeking the names of possible experts.

The Working Group asked the Director General to seek a candidate to succeed Dr Reda.

As items of interest, information and general relevance, of the working group briefly discussed the following:

- status of proposed UN Declaration on Animal Welfare

Appendix XIV (contd)

- interest shown by International Finance Corporation / World Bank Group in animal welfare guidelines and standards
- upcoming conferences in the Netherlands (2004), UK (CIWF in 2005) and USA (WVA/AVMA in 2005)
- current scientific interest in acute phase proteins as clinical indicators of animal disease or compromised animal welfare
- FAO interest in animal welfare in relation to Good Agricultural Practice.

The OIE Publications Department confirmed its interest in publishing a review entitled 'Animal Welfare: Global Challenges, Issues and Trends'. A Working Group sub-committee was established to scope and draft a project plan in respect of the OIE's proposal.

The Working Group agreed to ask the OIE to respond formally to Joyce D'Silva, Chief Executive of Compassion in World Farming, referring to the CIWF letter writing campaign supporting the conference and clarifying the issues in respect of the reference to intensive production systems in the OIE review.

6. Work programme

On the basis of the above discussion, the Working Group reviewed progress against the current work programme (Appendix D) and agreed a work programme for 2004/2005 (Appendix E).

7. Next meeting

The Working Group agreed to meet again in about 12 months time to review progress, and formulate the 2005/2006 work programme.

SECOND MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE

Paris, 26-27 February 2004

List of participants

MEMBERS OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP

Dr David Bayvel (Chair)

Director Animal Welfare
MAF Biosecurity Authority
Box 2526
Wellington
NEW ZEALAND
Tel.: (64-4) 4744251
Fax: (64-4) 4989888
E-mail: bayveld@maf.govt.nz

Dr David Fraser

Professor and Chair in Animal Welfare
Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and
Centre for Applied Ethics
University of British Columbia
2357 Main Mall-Suite 248
Vancouver V6T 1Z4
CANADA
Tel.: (1-604) 822 2040
Fax.: (1-604) 822 4400
E-mail: fraserd@interchg.ubc.ca

Dr Walter N. Masiga

Box 47926
Nairobi
KENYA
E-mail: masiga@iconnect.co.ke

Prof. Dr Tore Håstein

*Past-President of the OIE Fish
Diseases Commission*
National Veterinary Institute
Ullevålsveien 68
P.O. Box 8156 Dep.
0033 Oslo
NORWAY
Tel. : (47-23) 21 61 50
Fax : (47-23) 21 60 01
E-mail : tore.hastein@vetinst.no

Dr Andrea Gavinelli

Administrator
Directorate General Health and
Consumer Protection
Unit E2 – Animal Health and Welfare,
Zootechnics
European Commission
Rue Froissart 101 – 2/54
1040 Brussels
BELGIUM
Tel.: (32-2) 2966426
Fax: (32-2) 2953144
E-mail: Andrea.Gavinelli@cec.eu.int

Dr Sira Abdul Rahman

Retd. Dean Bangalore Veterinary College
No 123, 7th B Main Road
4th Block(West)
Jayanagar, Bangalore 560 011
INDIA
Tel.: (91-80) 26532168
Fax: (91-80) 26635210
E-mail: shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in

Prof Dr I.M. Reda (Absent)

Faculty of Veterinary Medicine
University of Cairo
GIZA (12211)
Cairo
EGYPT
Tel.: (20 2) 571 03 09
Fax: (20 2) 572 52 40
E-mail: imreda@yahoo.com

OTHER PARTICIPANTS

Dr Alex Thiermann

*President of the OIE Terrestrial Animal
Health Standards Commission*
US Mission to the Organisation for
Economic Co-operation and Development
19, rue de Franqueville
75016 Paris
FRANCE
Tel: 33-(0)1 44 15 18 69
Fax: 33-(0)1 42 67 09 87
E-mail: a.thiermann@oie.int

Dr David Wilkins (Observer)

Secretary
ICFAW
c/o WSPA, 89, Albert Embankment
London SE1 7TP
UK
Tel: (44) 1403 241235
Fax: (44) 1403 241235
Email : wilkinsvet@lycos.co.uk

Appendix XIV (contd)

Appendix A (contd)

OIE HEADQUARTERS

Dr Bernard Vallat

Director General
12, rue de Prony
75017 Paris
FRANCE
Tel: 33 - (0)1 44 15 18 88
Fax: 33 - (0)1 42 67 09 87
E-mail: bie@oie.int

Dr D. Wilson

Head
International Trade Department
OIE
Tel.: 33 (0)1 44.15.18.80
Fax: 33 (0)1 42.67.09.87
E-mail: d.wilson@oie.int

Dr Antonio Petrini

Chargé de mission
International Trade Department
OIE
Tel.: 33 (0)1 44.15.18.89
Fax: 33 (0)1 42.67.09.87
E-mail: a.petrini@oie.int

SECOND MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE

Paris, 26-27 February 2004

Agenda

1. Introduction
 2. Review of 2003 OIE activities on animal welfare
 - Reports from OIE Ad hoc Group meetings
 3. Generic guiding principles on Animal Welfare (for adoption)
 4. Outcomes from the Global OIE Conference on Animal Welfare
 5. Operational Plan for 2004
 - Priorities for *ad hoc* Groups
 - OIE Revue Scientifique et Technique
 - Consultation issues
 6. Other Business
 - WSPA UN declaration
 - WVA conference planning 2005 USA
 - WG Membership
 7. Agreed actions
 8. Next meeting
-

SCIENTIFIC BASIS FOR GUIDELINES

1. Welfare is a broad term which includes the many elements that contribute to an animal's quality of life, including those referred to in the 'five freedoms' listed above.
 2. The scientific assessment of animal welfare has progressed rapidly in recent years and forms the basis of these guidelines.
 3. Some measures of animal welfare involve assessing the degree of impaired functioning associated with injury, disease, and malnutrition. Other measures provide information on animals' needs and affective states such as hunger, pain and fear, often by measuring the strength of animals' preferences, motivations and aversions. Others assess the physiological, behavioural and immunological changes or effects that animals show in response to various challenges.
 4. Such measures can lead to criteria and indicators that help to evaluate how different methods of managing animals influence their welfare.
-

Animal Welfare Working Group 2003 work programme

	Decisions of Working Group	Implementation	Status at February 2004
Mission, guiding principles and policies	OIE process for adoption by International Committee	Working Group members to comment within 4 weeks, then OIE to include in Code Commission report	Mission and policies accepted by Member Countries in May 2003; guiding principles for adoption at May 2004 General Session
Standards and guidelines	Proposed order of work 1. Transport by land 2. Killing for disease control (as per scope) 3. Humane slaughter (as per scope) 4. Transport by sea.	2003 2003 2004 2004	All four <i>ad hoc</i> Groups met during 2003; meeting reports have been circulated to Member Countries for comment, via Working Group and Code Commission
Expertise database	Identification of possible expertise (centres of expertise and individual experts)	Initial information from Working Group members by mid-November 2002	Database in existence, but data inadequate to date
Animal welfare conference	Initial proposals from Drs Gavinelli, Rahman and Fraser re format, participants, outcomes to include academia, research, funding, collaboration	Proposals to OIE by mid-December 2002 Conference planned for second half 2003	OIE Global Animal Welfare Conference 23-25 February 2004
Presentation at OIE General Session	Paper by member of Working Group and questions from Member Country delegates	May 2003	Chair of Working Group presented paper on Working Group activities

Appendix XIV (contd)Appendix D (contd)**Animal Welfare Working Group 2003 work programme (contd)**

	Decisions of Working Group	Implementation	Status at February 2004
Improved animal welfare awareness in teaching	Drs Bayvel, Masiga and Fraser to draft letter from OIE for veterinary schools; coordinate with WVA activities	February 2003	Inadequate progress due to lack of resources at the OIE
Animal welfare research initiative	Drs Bayvel, Masiga and Fraser to provide input into conference programme (Dr Gavinelli) and text for OIE Web site, re research initiatives and associated funding needs	February 2003	Inadequate progress due to lack of resources at the OIE
Collaboration among academic and research institutions	Dr Fraser to provide input into conference programme (Dr Gavinelli)	February 2003	Completed
Communications plan	Working Group members to take up opportunities for publishing information articles in appropriate journals, Web pages and newsletters;	Continuing	Completed
	Working Group members to utilise OIE Regional conferences, and other relevant conferences;	Continuing	Reports on OIE activities presented
	OIE to develop slide show for Working Group members and other speaker use;	mid November 2002	Slide show developed, and used by members
	Working Group members to provide stakeholder list for circulation of OIE information;	mid December 2002	Some progress, further work required
	Relationship with other international organisations involved in animal welfare activities to be communicated by OIE	mid December 2002	Progress during conference; work to continue
Future activities / emerging issues	Aquaculture animal welfare	Report from Professor Tore Hastein for next meeting;	Prof Hastein gave presentation at Conference
	Animal biotechnology	Summary paper and perhaps presentation at 2003 conference	No progress as low priority

Animal Welfare Working Group 2004/2005 work programme

	Decisions of Working Group	Implementation	Status at February 2004
Guiding principles	To be submitted for adoption by International Committee	To revise text on 'scientific basis for guidelines' by end April (Fraser)	
Development of guidelines	<p>Priorities identified</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Transport by land (including by rail) 2. Transport by sea 3. Humane slaughter for human consumption 4. Killing for disease control 5. Aquaculture animal welfare 6. Transport by air 	<p>continue, with second meeting during 2004</p> <p>Terms of reference to cover:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - production, transport and slaughter - freshwater, saltwater and ornamental fish and appropriate membership, by May 2004 (Hastein) <p>Liaison with IATA to continue; OIE to ensure that pre- and post-flight issues are addressed (Fraser)</p>	
Expertise database	Identification of possible expertise (centres of expertise and individual experts)	Continuing (all)	
Presentation at OIE General Session	Chair of Working Group to present paper and respond to questions from Member Country delegates	May 2004 (Bayvel)	
Improved animal welfare awareness in veterinary curriculum and CPD	Coordinate with WVA / CVA activities	Continuing (Rahman)	

Appendix XIV (contd)Appendix E (contd)**Animal Welfare Working Group 2004/2005 work programme (contd)**

	Decisions of Working Group	Implementation	Status at February 2004
Collaboration among academic and research institutions re animal welfare research	to contact ISAE and ISAH re collaboration	continuing (Fraser) (Gavinelli)	Collaboration among academic and research institutions re animal welfare research
Communications plan	<p>Working Group members to take up opportunities for publishing information articles in appropriate journals, Web pages and newsletters</p> <p>Working Group members to utilise OIE Regional conferences, and other relevant conferences</p> <p>OIE to develop animal welfare CD-ROM for Working Group members and Delegate use</p> <p>OIE and the WTO to draft a document clarifying the international legal issues associated with animal welfare and international trade</p> <p>To liaise with CIWF re March 2005 conference re speaker opportunity</p> <p>To liaise with governments and international organisations re animal welfare topics at upcoming conferences:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Netherlands conference, December 2004 - WVA conference, July 2005 <p>Working Group members to provide stakeholder information for use by OIE</p>	<p>Continuing (All)</p> <p>Continuing (All)</p> <p>end 2004 (Maria Zampaglione)</p> <p>end April (Thiermann)</p> <p>(Bayvel)</p> <p>Continuing (All)</p> <p>(Gavinelli) (Bayvel)</p> <p>(All)</p>	
<i>OIE Revue Scientifique et Technique</i>	Request to coordinate mid-2005 edition on animal welfare	(Bayvel, Rahman, Gavinelli)	
Membership	Member drawn from animal industries with an interest in animal transport, production and slaughter.	Director General to write to relevant international organisations	

Future work programme for the Terrestrial Animal Health Standards Commission

Topic	Action	How to be managed
Traceability	The OIE requests Member Countries to submit proposals and draft texts which could form the basis of guidelines.	The Animal Production Food Safety Working Group has listed this topic as a priority.
Zoning/regionalisation and compartmentalisation	The OIE has been requested to develop guidelines to aid Member Countries in the implementation of these concepts.	The Code Commission will examine submitted proposals.
Reorganisation of Terrestrial Code	In view of the new single disease list and the development of new chapters in Part 1 of the <i>Terrestrial Code</i> , the Bureau of the Code Commission requested the Central Bureau to submit revised contents pages for the January 2005 meeting.	The Central Bureau will draft.
Paratuberculosis	A revised draft chapter on paratuberculosis, developed by an expert in consultation with others, was discussed with the Scientific Commission in December 2003. The Scientific Commission made no specific comments but recommended that the zoonotic potential of this disease be addressed through collaboration with the WHO.	The Code Commission will circulate the revised draft for the comment of Member Countries when it has received appropriate technical review from the Scientific Commission.
Anthrax	To develop an appendix on the inactivation of the bacillary and spore forms of <i>Bacillus anthracis</i> .	The Central Bureau will contact experts, utilising the scientific data underlying proposals made to the International Committee in 2002.
Semen and embryos	To harmonise the semen and embryo chapters.	Experts are working on the chapter on small ruminant semen to harmonise it with the chapter on bovine semen, with the ultimate intention of having a single semen chapter.
Terrestrial Code texts in need of revision	To revise certain chapters and appendices, including swine vesicular disease, African swine fever, equine infectious anaemia.	
	Salmonellosis, cysticercosis, bovine brucellosis.	The Animal Production Food Safety Working Group has listed these topics as priorities.