
The members of the Working Group and other participants are listed in Appendix A. The Agenda adopted is given in Appendix B. Dr. D. Bayvel chaired the meeting.

On behalf of Dr. B. Vallat, Director General of the OIE, Dr. D. Wilson, Head of the International Trade Department, welcomed the members of the Working Group and thanked them for agreeing to continue their work on this important mandate of the OIE. He also welcomed Dr. D. Wilkins as an observer to the Working Group; Dr. Wilkins explained the role of the organisation of which he is secretary, the International Coalition for Farm Animal Welfare (ICFAW). Dr. Wilkins regretted that he was only able to participate in the meeting on the first day. Dr. Wilson noted that Dr. I.M. Reda could not be present due to illness.

1. Animal Welfare Conference

The Working Group strongly believed that the OIE’s Global Animal Welfare Conference which had just concluded had achieved its aims, and that the formula of stakeholder participation had been successful. It believed that future conferences should be more narrowly focused and perhaps aligned with particular interests or needs at a regional level.

The Working Group believed that the success of the Conference was in a large part due to the planning of the Steering Committee, and the efforts of the OIE Central Office staff in the organisation and running of the Conference. From its viewpoint, the principal Conference outcomes had been:

- an enhanced understanding of the OIE’s mandate, procedures, work to date and aims regarding animal welfare by a diverse group of participants, some of which had never before dealt with the OIE;
- an appreciation of the challenges of animal welfare as a global issue;
- a very strong endorsement of OIE’s leadership role in animal welfare;
- the initiation of a positive dialogue.
Appendix XIV (contd)

The Working Group emphasised the need for the OIE to enhance the understanding of Delegates during the General Session of the OIE’s animal welfare work. A process has been established and the first steps towards animal welfare guidelines taken, on a continuous improvement basis.

The Working Group made the following comments on the outcomes of syndicate group discussions not involving an existing ad hoc Group:

a) Animal welfare in the veterinary curriculum
   - The Working Group recommended that under-graduate veterinary curricula and continuing education programmes include animal welfare and ethics.
   - The Working Group recommended that the OIE consult with the World Veterinary Association (WVA) and other international veterinary and scientific associations, to ensure that suitable resource material is made available to Delegates for use in veterinary curricula within Member Countries.

b) Research
   - The Working Group encouraged the animal welfare ad hoc Groups to identify any research topics needing to be investigated to provide scientific information regarding issues under their consideration.
   - The Working Group recommended that the OIE make available to research providers the above topics to encourage funding organisations to support relevant and appropriate research.

c) Animal welfare and international trade
   The Working Group recommended that the OIE and the World Trade Organization draft a document clarifying the international legal issues and treaty obligations associated with animal welfare and international trade.

d) Companion animals
   - The Working Group recommended that the OIE examine in due course the applicability to companion animals of the guidelines being developed for animals in agriculture and aquaculture.
   - The Working Group noted that some Conference participants had highlighted the animal / human health and animal welfare importance of effective stray dog control with particular reference to rabies.

e) Wildlife and animals in research
   - The Working Group recommended that the OIE liaise closely with relevant international organisations when developing animal welfare guidelines dealing with wildlife and animals in research.
   - The Working Group recommended that the OIE Working Group on Wildlife Diseases consider animal welfare aspects as well as diseases of wildlife in its future work.

f) Communications
   - Noting that the Conference had encouraged greater transparency in the OIE’s deliberations, the Working Group believed that the OIE may need to examine its communication and decision-making processes to ensure that consultation on animal welfare issues be as efficient as possible; the Working Group recommended that the OIE make public at an earlier stage reports of Working Group and ad hoc Group meetings; the Working Group also noted the importance of the OIE publicising upcoming meetings of ad hoc Groups to enhance stakeholder input.
The Working Group recommended that the OIE develop a long-term communication strategy for animal welfare.

The Working Group recommended that the OIE communicate its long-term animal welfare strategy to enhance stakeholder understanding and participation.

The Working Group recommended that the OIE develop and advise a single contact point for its animal welfare programme.

The Working Group recommended that Delegates communicate within their countries on upcoming OIE animal welfare issues and ensure that relevant stakeholders are included in the preparation of country comments on draft guidelines, etc.

The Working Group recommended that stakeholders keep their Delegates informed on their activities and that all communications with the OIE should involve the relevant Delegate.

The Working Group noted the need for improved regional awareness of new OIE standards using dialogue with local stakeholders, specialised conferences and Regional Commissions.

The Working Group recommended that the OIE forge a strong relationship with key international scientific organisations, e.g. the International Society for Applied Ethology (ISAE), the International Society for Animal Hygiene (ISAH).

2. Reports of ad hoc Group meetings

The Working Group recalled that the reports of the 2003 meetings of the four animal welfare ad hoc Groups had been circulated to Working Group members for comment, prior to being submitted to the Code Commission. The Code Commission had endorsed the reports at its December 2003 meeting and circulated them for the comment of Member Countries. The Working Group commended the four ad hoc Groups on their excellent work to date.

The Working Group reiterated the importance of aquatic animal welfare being addressed as a matter of priority, through an ad hoc Group being assembled to address rearing, transport and slaughter issues for aquatic animals.

The Working Group then discussed each of the reports in the light of the outcomes of the Conference and made proposals for the ad hoc Groups to consider at their next meetings:

a) General

− The Working Group noted the need for harmonised definitions and recommended that the chairs of all the ad hoc Groups work towards a single list for inclusion in the Terrestrial Code.

− The Working Group strongly supported the principle that animal handlers be competent and that training of such operators was an important factor in animal welfare, and recommended that more specific requirements for competence be written through coordination with AATA/IATA.

− The Working Group recommended that expertise on specific issues be added to the OIE expertise database for use by ad hoc Groups and by Member Countries.

b) Slaughter for human consumption

The Working Group noted that the ad hoc Group had considered the important issue of religious slaughter and that it had recognised that the guiding principles applied equally to religious slaughter; the Working Group encouraged the ad hoc Group to continue to develop specific guidelines to address the issue.
c) Killing for disease control purposes
   - The Working Group supported the decision of the ad hoc Group that procedures requiring specific commercial equipment should not be included in OIE guidelines; references to such procedures could be made.
   - The Working Group noted the importance of the testing and updating of national contingency plans.

d) Land and sea transport
   - The Working Group encouraged the ad hoc Groups to more tightly specify fitness to travel issues (including pregnancy considerations).
   - The Working Group recommended that the issue of ‘roll-on-roll-off’ transport be further addressed, especially with regard to the duration of a journey.

3. Generic guiding principles on animal welfare

The Working Group considered again its generic guiding principles proposed for adoption at the General Session, and supported their adoption.

The Working Group considered that the Article on the scientific basis for guidelines contained some inconsistencies and redundancies, and could be strengthened; it agreed a revised text for this article which would be submitted for adoption. The Working Group considered that the ethical basis for guidelines was adequately covered in the Terrestrial Code and in the generic guiding principles, and that this specific text could be deleted. The revised text is at Appendix C.

4. Aquaculture animal welfare

The Working Group discussed a work programme for aquaculture animal welfare and how best it could be implemented. It considered that an ad hoc Group or Groups should be set up specifically to address aquaculture animal welfare, rather than for aquaculture to be added to the scope of the work of existing ad hoc Groups; the Working Group supported this approach.

It was decided that Professor Hastein would propose to the other members terms of reference to cover production, transport and slaughter issues for freshwater, saltwater and ornamental fish, and appropriate membership of the ad hoc Group(s).

5. Other business

The Working Group discussed its future membership needs. It noted positively the establishment of an international coalition of animal welfare organisations, ICFAW. It welcomed the participation of Dr Wilkins as an observer, due to the expertise he brought to its discussions and his demonstrated ability to communicate with a broad range of animal welfare NGOs. It recommended to the Director General that he become a full member of the Working Group.

The Working Group is also seeking direct participation of an expert drawn from animal industries with expertise in animal transport, production and slaughter, and with good communication networks with such industries. The Working Group asked the Director General to write to relevant international organisations, seeking the names of possible experts.

The Working Group asked the Director General to seek a candidate to succeed Dr Reda.

As items of interest, information and general relevance, of the working group briefly discussed the following:
   - status of proposed UN Declaration on Animal Welfare
interest shown by International Finance Corporation / Word Bank Group in animal welfare guidelines and standards

- upcoming conferences in the Netherlands (2004), UK (CIWF in 2005) and USA (WVA/AVMA in 2005)

- current scientific interest in acute phase proteins as clinical indicators of animal disease or compromised animal welfare

- FAO interest in animal welfare in relation to Good Agricultural Practice.

The OIE Publications Department confirmed its interest in publishing a review entitled ‘Animal Welfare: Global Challenges, Issues and Trends’. A Working Group sub-committee was established to scope and draft a project plan in respect of the OIE’s proposal.

The Working Group agreed to ask the OIE to respond formally to Joyce D'Silva, Chief Executive of Compassion in World Farming, referring to the CIWF letter writing campaign supporting the conference and clarifying the issues in respect of the reference to intensive production systems in the OIE review.

6. Work programme

On the basis of the above discussion, the Working Group reviewed progress against the current work programme (Appendix D) and agreed a work programme for 2004/2005 (Appendix E).

7. Next meeting

The Working Group agreed to meet again in about 12 months time to review progress, and formulate the 2005/2006 work programme.
SECOND MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE

Paris, 26-27 February 2004

List of participants

MEMBERS OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title and Organization</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Contact Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr David Bayvel</td>
<td>Chair, Director Animal Welfare, MAF Biosecurity Authority</td>
<td>Wellington, NEW ZEALAND</td>
<td>Tel.: (64-4) 4744251, Fax: (64-4) 4989888, E-mail: <a href="mailto:bayveld@maf.govt.nz">bayveld@maf.govt.nz</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr David Fraser</td>
<td>Professor and Chair in Animal Welfare, Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and Centre for Applied Ethics</td>
<td>Vancouver, CANADA</td>
<td>Tel.: (1-604) 822 2040, Fax: (1-604) 822 4400, E-mail: <a href="mailto:fraserd@interchg.ubc.ca">fraserd@interchg.ubc.ca</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Walter N. Masiga</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nairobi, KENYA</td>
<td>E-mail: <a href="mailto:masiga@iconnect.co.ke">masiga@iconnect.co.ke</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr Tore Håstein</td>
<td>Past-President of the OIE Fish Diseases Commission, National Veterinary Institute</td>
<td>Oslo, NORWAY</td>
<td>Tel.: (47-23) 21 61 50, Fax: (47-23) 21 60 01, E-mail: <a href="mailto:tore.hastein@vetinst.no">tore.hastein@vetinst.no</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Andrea Gavinelli</td>
<td>Administrator, Directorate General Health and Consumer Protection, Unit E2 – Animal Health and Welfare, Zootechnics, European Commission</td>
<td>Brussels, BELGIUM</td>
<td>Tel.: (32-2) 2966426, Fax: (32-2) 2953144, E-mail: <a href="mailto:Andrea.Gavinelli@cec.eu.int">Andrea.Gavinelli@cec.eu.int</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Sira Abdul Rahman</td>
<td>Retd. Dean Bangalore Veterinary College</td>
<td>Bangalore, INDIA</td>
<td>Tel.: (91-80) 26532168, Fax: (91-80) 26635210, E-mail: <a href="mailto:shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in">shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OTHER PARTICIPANTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title and Organization</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Contact Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr Alex Thiermann</td>
<td>President of the OIE Terrestrial Animal Health Standards Commission</td>
<td>Paris, FRANCE</td>
<td>Tel: 33-(0)1 44 15 18 69, Fax: 33-(0)1 42 67 09 87, E-mail: <a href="mailto:a_thiermann@oie.int">a_thiermann@oie.int</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr David Wilkins (Observer)</td>
<td>Secretary, ICFAW, c/o WSPA, 89, Albert Embankment</td>
<td>London, UK</td>
<td>Tel: (44) 1403 241235, Fax: (44) 1403 241235, Email: <a href="mailto:wilkinsvet@lycos.co.uk">wilkinsvet@lycos.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bureau of the OIE Terrestrial Animal Health Standards Commission/June-July 2004
Appendix XIV (contd)

Appendix A (contd)

OIE HEADQUARTERS

Dr Bernard Vallat
Director General
12, rue de Prony
75017 Paris
FRANCE
Tel: 33 - (0)1 44 15 18 88
Fax: 33 - (0)1 42 67 09 87
E-mail: oie@oie.int

Dr D. Wilson
Head
International Trade Department
OIE
Tel.: 33 (0)1 44.15.18.80
Fax: 33 (0)1 42.67.09.87
E-mail: d.wilson@oie.int

Dr Antonio Petrini
Chargé de mission
International Trade Department
OIE
Tel.: 33 (0)1 44.15.18.89
Fax: 33 (0)1 42.67.09.87
E-mail: a.petrini@oie.int
SECOND MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE

Paris, 26-27 February 2004

Agenda

1. Introduction
2. Review of 2003 OIE activities on animal welfare
   − Reports from OIE Ad hoc Group meetings
3. Generic guiding principles on Animal Welfare (for adoption)
4. Outcomes from the Global OIE Conference on Animal Welfare
5. Operational Plan for 2004
   − Priorities for ad hoc Groups
   − OIE Revue Scientifique et Technique
   − Consultation issues
6. Other Business
   − WSPA UN declaration
   − WVA conference planning 2005 USA
   − WG Membership
7. Agreed actions
8. Next meeting
SCIENTIFIC BASIS FOR GUIDELINES

1. Welfare is a broad term which includes the many elements that contribute to an animal's quality of life, including those referred to in the 'five freedoms' listed above.

2. The scientific assessment of animal welfare has progressed rapidly in recent years and forms the basis of these guidelines.

3. Some measures of animal welfare involve assessing the degree of impaired functioning associated with injury, disease, and malnutrition. Other measures provide information on animals' needs and affective states such as hunger, pain and fear, often by measuring the strength of animals' preferences, motivations and aversions. Others assess the physiological, behavioural and immunological changes or effects that animals show in response to various challenges.

4. Such measures can lead to criteria and indicators that help to evaluate how different methods of managing animals influence their welfare.
## Animal Welfare Working Group 2003 work programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decisions of Working Group</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Status at February 2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mission, guiding principles and policies</td>
<td>OIE process for adoption by International Committee</td>
<td>Working Group members to comment within 4 weeks, then OIE to include in Code Commission report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Standards and guidelines | Proposed order of work  
1. Transport by land  
2. Killing for disease control (as per scope)  
3. Humane slaughter (as per scope)  
4. Transport by sea. |  
2003  
2003  
2004  
2004 | All four ad hoc Groups met during 2003; meeting reports have been circulated to Member Countries for comment, via Working Group and Code Commission |
| Expertise database | Identification of possible expertise (centres of expertise and individual experts) | Initial information from Working Group members by mid-November 2002 | Database in existence, but data inadequate to date |
| Animal welfare conference | Initial proposals from Drs Gavinelli, Rahman and Fraser re format, participants, outcomes  
. to include academia, research, funding, collaboration | Proposals to OIE by mid-December 2002  
<p>| Presentation at OIE General Session | Paper by member of Working Group and questions from Member Country delegates | May 2003 | Chair of Working Group presented paper on Working Group activities |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decisions of Working Group</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Status at February 2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Improved animal welfare awareness in teaching</td>
<td>Drs Bayvel, Masiga and Fraser to draft letter from OIE for veterinary schools; coordinate with WVA activities</td>
<td>February 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal welfare research initiative</td>
<td>Drs Bayvel, Masiga and Fraser to provide input into conference programme (Dr Gavinelli) and text for OIE Web site, re research initiatives and associated funding needs</td>
<td>February 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration among academic and research institutions</td>
<td>Dr Fraser to provide input into conference programme (Dr Gavinelli)</td>
<td>February 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communications plan</td>
<td>Working Group members to take up opportunities for publishing information articles in appropriate journals, Web pages and newsletters; Working Group members to utilise OIE Regional conferences, and other relevant conferences; OIE to develop slide show for Working Group members and other speaker use; Working Group members to provide stakeholder list for circulation of OIE information; Relationship with other international organisations involved in animal welfare activities to be communicated by OIE</td>
<td>Continuing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future activities / emerging issues</td>
<td>Aquaculture animal welfare</td>
<td>Report from Professor Tore Hastein for next meeting; Summary paper and perhaps presentation at 2003 conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Animal biotechnology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decisions of Working Group</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Status at February 2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guiding principles</td>
<td>To be submitted for adoption by International Committee</td>
<td>To revise text on 'scientific basis for guidelines' by end April (Fraser)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of guidelines</td>
<td>Priorities identified 1. Transport by land (including by rail) 2. Transport by sea 3. Humane slaughter for human consumption 4. Killing for disease control 5. Aquaculture animal welfare 6. Transport by air</td>
<td>continue, with second meeting during 2004 continue, with second meeting during 2004 continue, with second meeting during 2004 Terms of reference to cover: - production, transport and slaughter - freshwater, saltwater and ornamental fish and appropriate membership, by May 2004 (Hastein) Liaison with IATA to continue; OIE to ensure that pre- and post-flight issues are addressed (Fraser)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expertise database</td>
<td>Identification of possible expertise (centres of expertise and individual experts)</td>
<td>Continuing (all)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation at OIE General Session</td>
<td>Chair of Working Group to present paper and respond to questions from Member Country delegates</td>
<td>May 2004 (Bayvel)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved animal welfare awareness in veterinary curriculum and CPD</td>
<td>Coordinate with WVA / CVA activities</td>
<td>Continuing (Rahman)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Animal Welfare Working Group 2004/2005 work programme (contd)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Collaboration among academic and research institutions re animal welfare research</th>
<th>Decisions of Working Group</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Status at February 2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>to contact ISAE and ISAH re collaboration</td>
<td>continuing (Fraser) (Gavinelli)</td>
<td>Collaboration among academic and research institutions re animal welfare research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Communications plan

- Working Group members to take up opportunities for publishing information articles in appropriate journals, Web pages and newsletters
- Working Group members to utilise OIE Regional conferences, and other relevant conferences
- OIE to develop animal welfare CD-ROM for Working Group members and Delegate use
- OIE and the WTO to draft a document clarifying the international legal issues associated with animal welfare and international trade
- To liaise with CIWF re March 2005 conference re speaker opportunity
- To liaise with governments and international organisations re animal welfare topics at upcoming conferences:
  - Netherlands conference, December 2004
  - WVA conference, July 2005
- Working Group members to provide stakeholder information for use by OIE

### OIE Revue Scientifique et Technique

Request to coordinate mid-2005 edition on animal welfare

### Membership

Member drawn from animal industries with an interest in animal transport, production and slaughter.

Director General to write to relevant international organisations
### Future work programme for the Terrestrial Animal Health Standards Commission

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>How to be managed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Traceability</strong></td>
<td>The OIE requests Member Countries to submit proposals and draft texts which could form the basis of guidelines.</td>
<td>The Animal Production Food Safety Working Group has listed this topic as a priority.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Zoning/regionalisation and compartmentalisation</strong></td>
<td>The OIE has been requested to develop guidelines to aid Member Countries in the implementation of these concepts.</td>
<td>The Code Commission will examine submitted proposals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reorganisation of Terrestrial Code</strong></td>
<td>In view of the new single disease list and the development of new chapters in Part 1 of the <em>Terrestrial Code</em>, the Bureau of the Code Commission requested the Central Bureau to submit revised contents pages for the January 2005 meeting.</td>
<td>The Central Bureau will draft.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Paratuberculosis</strong></td>
<td>A revised draft chapter on paratuberculosis, developed by an expert in consultation with others, was discussed with the Scientific Commission in December 2003. The Scientific Commission made no specific comments but recommended that the zoonotic potential of this disease be addressed through collaboration with the WHO.</td>
<td>The Code Commission will circulate the revised draft for the comment of Member Countries when it has received appropriate technical review from the Scientific Commission.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anthrax</strong></td>
<td>To develop an appendix on the inactivation of the bacillary and spore forms of <em>Bacillus anthracis</em>.</td>
<td>The Central Bureau will contact experts, utilising the scientific data underlying proposals made to the International Committee in 2002.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Semen and embryos</strong></td>
<td>To harmonise the semen and embryo chapters.</td>
<td>Experts are working on the chapter on small ruminant semen to harmonise it with the chapter on bovine semen, with the ultimate intention of having a single semen chapter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Terrestrial Code texts in need of revision</strong></td>
<td>To revise certain chapters and appendices, including swine vesicular disease, African swine fever, equine infectious anaemia.</td>
<td>The Animal Production Food Safety Working Group has listed these topics as priorities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Salmonellosis, cysticercosis, bovine brucellosis.*